1977

A Study of Three Methods of Presenting Short Stories.

Richard L. Powers
Louisiana State University and Agricultural & Mechanical College

INFORMATION TO USERS

This material was produced from a microfilm copy of the original document. While the most advanced technological means to photograph and reproduce this document have been used, the quality is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original submitted.

The following explanation of techniques is provided to help you understand markings or patterns which may appear on this reproduction.

1. The sign or "target" for pages apparently lacking from the document photographed is "Missing Page(s)". If it was possible to obtain the missing page(s) or section, they are spliced into the film along with adjacent pages. This may have necessitated cutting thru an image and duplicating adjacent pages to insure you complete continuity.

2. When an image on the film is obliterated with a large round black mark, it is an indication that the photographer suspected that the copy may have moved during exposure and thus cause a blurred image. You will find a good image of the page in the adjacent frame.

3. When a map, drawing or chart, etc., was part of the material being photographed the photographer followed a definite method in "sectioning" the material. It is customary to begin photoing at the upper left hand corner of a large sheet and to continue photoing from left to right in equal sections with a small overlap. If necessary, sectioning is continued again — beginning below the first row and continuing on until complete.

4. The majority of users indicate that the textual content is of greatest value, however, a somewhat higher quality reproduction could be made from "photographs" if essential to the understanding of the dissertation. Silver prints of "photographs" may be ordered at additional charge by writing the Order Department, giving the catalog number, title, author and specific pages you wish reproduced.

5. PLEASE NOTE: Some pages may have indistinct print. Filmed as received.

University Microfilms International
300 North Zeeb Road
Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106 USA
St. John's Road, Tyler's Green
High Wycombe, Bucks, England HP10 8HR

A STUDY OF THREE METHODS OF PRESENTING SHORT STORIES

A Dissertation

Submitted to the Graduate Faculty of the
Louisiana State University and
Agricultural and Mechanical College
in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in

The Department of Education

by

Richard L. Powers
B.S., East Carolina University, 1948
M.Ed., Louisiana State University, 1961

August, 1977

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The writer wishes to thank the members of his committee, Dr. Charlie W. Roberts, Jr., Mr. David Madden, Dr. Sam Adams, Dr. B. F. Beeson, Dr. G. C. Gibson, Dr. L. L. Kilgore, and Dr. W. J. McJulien, for the assistance they rendered in the writing of this dissertation.

Special thanks are due Dr. Roberts for his humane and expert guidance during this study and throughout the writer's doctoral program. Appreciation is also expressed to Mr. Madden for the insights he contributed from the vantage point of the professional writer. Dr. Adams made essential contributions in the design of this experiment and in the analysis of the resulting data.

The cooperation and assistance of personnel of the East Baton Rouge Parish Public Schools is also gratefully acknowledged, especially that of the six teachers who participated directly in the presentations and testing: Mrs. Elizabeth Arnold, Mrs. Jane Dickinson, Mrs. Barbara Freiberg, Mrs. Vickie Spiers, Mrs. Diane Stewart, and Mrs. Sarah Wright. Mr. Philip D. Ward made a particularly important contribution with his audio-recorded readings of the four short stories. Recognition must also go to Dr. Perry Guedry, Supervisor of Educational Media Services in the East Baton Rouge system, for his valuable support and assistance.

The writer would like to acknowledge the academic attainments of his sister and two brothers who preceded him in achieving doctorates and who thereby issued the challenge which became one of his primary motivations.

Finally, love and gratitude go to the writer's wife and daughters, who understood what was driving him and gave him all that he needed to persist in the endeavor.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

ABSTRACT

The problem of this study was to determine whether there would be any differences in the scores on tests on selected short stories among three groups of eleventh grade students who (1) read the stories, (2) viewed film versions of the stories, or (3) listened to recorded readings of them. An additional dimension of the problem was to uncover any such differences in the scores of students who attended schools of differing socioeconomic levels.

Four short stories in print, film, and audio recorded media were presented to three classes of one teacher from each of six high schools in Baton Rouge, Louisiana, a total of 201 students. Two of the high schools were classified as having high socioeconomic attendance districts, two were classified as having middle range socioeconomic attendance districts, and two were classified as having low socioeconomic attendance districts. Each of the six teachers had one class that read all four stories, one class that viewed all four films, and one class that listened to all four recordings.

The objective-referenced tests on the short stories were constructed by the investigator. All groups were held equal for reading ability by using the Total Reading score of the Comprehensive Tests of Basic Skills as covariate in analysis of covariance. All statistical tests were made at the .05 level of significance.

In the comparison of the adjusted means of the comprehensive groups, those students who read the stories (N = 66) were shown to have scored significantly higher than the students who viewed the film

versions of the stories (N = 60). The students who viewed the film versions were shown to have scored significantly higher than the students who listened to the recorded readings (N = 75).

In the high socioeconomic level schools, students who read the stories scored significantly higher than students who viewed the films and students who listened to the recordings; but there was no statistically significant difference between the scores of the listeners and the viewers.

There were no statistically significant differences among the scores of the three presentation mode groups in the middle range socioeconomic level schools.

In the low socioeconomic level schools, students who read the stories and students who viewed the films scored significantly higher than students who listened to the recordings; but there was no statistically significant difference between the scores of the readers and the viewers.

Six conclusions have been reached from these results.

1. Student reading of printed short stories is generally superior to the other methods and must not be displaced in the name of motivating students or dealing with problems of low reading ability.

2. Students are weak in listening skills.

3. Film versions of short stories are relatively more effective in the classroom than recorded readings of short stories.

4. Student reading is especially effective in high socioeconomic level schools.

5. Film versions and recordings are useful supplements to printed short stories in middle range socioeconomic schools.

6. Recordings of short stories do not seem to be effective in low socioeconomic schools.

Chapter 1

INTRODUCTION

Professional leadership among English teachers at the national level has recently stated the desirability of continuing to use a wide variety of instructional media in English classes (Hogan and Judy, 1976). Films, recordings, filmstrips, and other similar materials should be encouraged, they contend, in spite of pressure from back-to-basics advocates; for the use of such media increases the capacity of students to communicate rather than limiting it. The investigation of specific questions relevant to these contentions, therefore, seems appropriate for educational research.

STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

Is student achievement different in terms of measurable cognitive objectives derived from short stories when film versions of the stories or teacher-recorded oral readings of them are presented to students rather than the printed stories themselves? This question is the basis for the present study and is elaborated further only by the qualification that the groups be held equal in reading ability through suitable statistical procedures and by asking whether the answer will be the same when asked about students in schools of differing socio-economic levels. The basic question has been broken down as follows:

1. Will students who read short stories score differently on tests based on the stories from students who view film versions of them?

2. Will students who read short stories score differently on tests based on the stories from students who listen to recorded readings of them?

3. Will students who view film versions of short stories score differently on tests based on the stories from students who listen to recorded readings of them?

4. Will students from schools determined to have high, middle, and low socioeconomic attendance districts benefit equally (in terms of test scores) from the same modes of presentation (print, film, or recording)?

PURPOSE OF THE STUDY

The purpose of this study was to discover and analyze any differences in the scores (on a battery of objective-referenced achievement tests constructed by the investigator) of groups of students who read selected short stories, viewed film versions of them, or listened to recorded readings of them, such differences to be adjusted by analysis of covariance so as to hold all groups equal in reading ability. Since the sample was composed of students from schools classified as having high, middle, or low socioeconomic attendance districts, the questions raised about the differences among the presentation mode groups for the sample as a whole were also asked about the differences among the presentation mode groups at each of the three socioeconomic levels.

THE NEED FOR THE STUDY

Factual research information is needed in making instructional strategy decisions. Specifically, other researchers in the teaching of

short stories have called for further study of the film-viewing and reading comparison with socioeconomic status as a variable (Levinson, 1963) and the listening and reading comparison (Lewis, 1972). The suggestion is not made here that student reading experiences should be replaced by viewing films or listening to readings. The position is supported, however, that there is a need to examine separately and in concrete terms the relative usefulness of films, teacher-made recordings, and print versions as presentation modes to stimulate specified cognitive responses.

ASSUMPTIONS

The study was based upon the following assumptions:

1. that the subjects included in this study are representative of eleventh grade English students in East Baton Rouge Parish Public Schools

2. that the Comprehensive Tests of Basic Skills, Reading Vocabulary and Reading Comprehension sections (CTB/McGraw-Hill, 1975), provides a valid and reliable means for arriving at a functional covariate that will hold all subjects equal in reading ability when used in analysis of covariance

3. that the subjects participating represent normal hearing and vision ranges and distributions, including those that have been corrected to normal

4. that the time provided for participation is long enough to allow a high level of work

5. that the objective-referenced instrument devised by the investigator is at a level of difficulty appropriate for eleventh grade students.

HYPOTHESES

The twelve hypotheses generated by this study were expressed in the null form and tested at the .05 level of significance. The short stories test referred to in the hypotheses was a battery of achievement tests constructed by the investigator and based on four selected short stories.

H_1: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students who read selected stories and eleventh grade students who view film versions of these stories.

H_{1a}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving high socioeconomic areas who read selected stories and students in such schools who view film versions of these stories.

H_{1b}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving middle range socioeconomic areas who read selected stories and students in such schools who view film versions of these stories.

H_{1c}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving low socioeconomic areas who read selected stories and students in such schools who view film versions of these stories.

H_2: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students who read selected stories and eleventh grade students who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

H_{2a}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving high socioeconomic areas who read selected stories and students in such schools who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

H_{2b}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving middle range socioeconomic areas who read selected stories and students in such schools who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

H_{2c}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving low socioeconomic areas who read selected stories and students in such schools who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

H_3: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students who view film versions of selected stories and eleventh grade students who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

H_{3a}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving high socioeconomic areas who view film versions of selected stories and students in such schools who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

H_{3b}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving middle range socioeconomic areas who view film versions of selected stories and students in such schools who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

H_{3c}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving low

socioeconomic areas who view film versions of selected stories and students in such schools who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

Population Limitations

1. The study was limited to those students in the East Baton Rouge Parish Public Schools during the fall semester of 1976.

2. The study was limited to eleventh grade students in English phase elective courses open to eleventh graders or eleventh and twelfth graders.

3. The study was limited to three classes in each of six high schools.

4. The study was limited to the classes of one teacher in each of six high schools.

5. The study was limited to two high schools designated as serving high socioeconomic areas, two high schools designated as serving middle range socioeconomic areas, and two high schools designated as serving low socioeconomic areas.

6. The study was limited to those students who were in attendance for all of the class periods of presentation and testing.

Limitations of Instruments and Materials

1. Responses measured were limited to the kind that could be recorded through the medium of pencil-and-paper, multiple choice types of tests.

2. Short stories utilized were chosen from textbooks in use in eleventh grade English classes in the East Baton Rouge Parish Public Schools.

3. Color-sound film versions of the stories were selected from those available in the Media Center film library of the East Baton Rouge Parish Public Schools.

4. Readings of the stories were recorded on audio-cassettes by a qualified oral interpreter who is a male English teacher in an East Baton Rouge high school, not by the investigator.

DEFINITION OF TERMS

1. Short story: ". . . a relatively short fictional narrative which achieves its artistic unity through the careful interrelatedness of all its major parts: plot, character, point of view, tone, setting, and theme." (Maline and Berkley, 1967:1)

2. Film version of a short story: a motion picture based upon the content and aesthetic and moral intentions of a short story, usually less than thirty minutes in length.

3. Recorded reading of a short story: the audio-cassette recording of the oral reading of a short story in its entirety.

4. Objective-referenced achievement test: a test in which the items are constructed so as to represent specified content areas in terms of specific behavioral objectives on increasingly difficult levels of the cognitive domain.

5. Low socioeconomic school attendance district: a district served by a school in which over 35.2% of the children residing in the attendance area are eligible for the free school lunch program.

6. Middle range socioeconomic school attendance district: a district served by a school in which over 10% but not more than 35.2% of the children residing in the attendance area are eligible for the free school lunch program.

7. High socioeconomic school attendance district: a district served by a school in which less than 10% of the children residing in the attendance area are eligible for the free school lunch program.

8. Shot: a continuous set of visuals recorded on film in the interval between one activation of the camera release and its following deactivation.

9. Superimposition: the projection of two shots simultaneously, with one shot superimposed on the other.

10. Dissolve: a device for transition from one shot to another by having the last few seconds of one shot superimposed on the first few seconds of the next shot.

11. Quick cut: instantaneous change from one shot to the next with no transitional devices, often characterized by a series of very brief shots.

12. Time lapse photography: motion picture film exposed one frame at a time with a longer lapse of time between frames than is usual so that, if a filmed object is changing slowly, it will appear to change rapidly when the film is projected at standard speed.

13. Hawthorne effect: a confounding variable introduced into an experimental study by the consciousness of the subjects that they are being studied.

THE INSTRUMENTS

Two types of instruments were required for obtaining the data necessary for the accomplishment of this study: a standardized test of reading comprehension to establish a covariate for equalizing the groups that were compared and a battery of four achievement tests on the four

short stories to measure the criterion variable. The Comprehensive Tests of Basic Skills, Reading Vocabulary and Reading Comprehension sections (CTB/McGraw-Hill, 1975), was chosen for the former; and four twenty-one to twenty-three item multiple choice achievement tests on the stories were constructed by the investigator, based on a table of specifications, and were tested for reliability and item discrimination in a limited pilot study.

PROCEDURE

Description of the Three Groups

Group R, who read the four selected short stories, consisted of 66 students.

Group V, who viewed film versions of the four selected short stories, consisted of 60 students.

Group L, who listened to recorded readings of the four selected short stories, consisted of 75 students.

Each of the presentation mode groups included one class from each of the six high schools represented.

Procedure for Drawing Samples

Six high schools were chosen randomly from a list of three high socioeconomic background schools, three middle range socioeconomic background schools, and three low socioeconomic background schools so as to have two schools from each level.

Six eleventh grade English teachers, one at each of the schools, were selected to participate by either the principal or the assistant principal for instruction of the school.

Three of the classes of each of these teachers were selected from the teacher's total number of classes by choosing the ones with the largest proportion of eleventh grade students. The classes that became parts of Groups R, V, and L were determined randomly from among the three classes of each teacher. An important aspect of the study was for each teacher to be involved in all three presentation modes.

Variables

There were three variables in this study. The independent (treatment) variable was reading short stories, viewing film versions of short stories, and listening to recorded readings of short stories. The dependent variable was scores on the short story achievement tests. The covariate was scores on the Comprehensive Tests of Basic Skills (1975), reading sections.

Description of the Manipulation

All classes in all three groups were given the Comprehensive Tests of Basic Skills, reading sections. It was administered during the two weeks preceding the presentations of the stories at four schools and during the two weeks following the presentations at the other two schools.

The four short stories and their filmed and audio recorded versions were:

1. "The Tell-Tale Heart" by Edgar Allan Poe
2. "The Lottery" by Shirley Jackson
3. "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" by Nathaniel Hawthorne
4. "To Build a Fire" by Jack London.

All students were exposed to all four stories but by only one mode of presentation. Group R classes read all four stories, Group V classes

viewed film versions of all four stories, and Group L classes listened to recorded readings of all four stories. The presentations and achievement testing on the stories involved a four week period, each class being presented a story once a week. In the case of three of the stories, the test followed the presentation immediately in the same class period. In the case of "To Build a Fire," however, the test on the story followed the presentation after a twenty-four hour interval, for readers, listeners, and viewers. This adjustment was necessary because the listening time of this story consumed the whole class period, leaving no time for the test on the same day.

Collection of Data

The classroom teachers, who were furnished with precise written instructions, controlled all exposure of students to materials and administered both the CTBS reading test and the series of achievement tests. The tests were scored by the investigator.

Analysis of Data

Analysis of covariance was used to examine the differences in scores on the achievement tests among the three groups and the nine subgroups. The Total Reading score on the CTBS was used as covariate to hold all groups equal in terms of reading ability. The hypotheses were tested at the .05 level of significance.

PLAN OF PRESENTATION

The remainder of the report of this study is organized into four additional chapters. Chapter 2 is "Review of the Literature," Chapter 3 is "Design and Procedures," Chapter 4 is "Analysis of the Data," and Chapter 5 is "Conclusions."

Chapter 2

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

The professional and scholarly literature related to viewing film, listening, and silent reading as instructional methods is extensive. The present discussion of film is limited to a consideration of (1) problems in utilization, development, and theory; (2) general experimental research; (3) film as an approach to literature; and (4) experimental research involving comparisons of film and reading as methods. Listening is discussed in terms of (1) general research, (2) practice in the classroom, and (3) special research that compares listening and reading as methods. Reading is considered only in relation to the other two methods, and an examination of research that compares all three approaches in the same experiments concludes this chapter.

FILM: UTILIZATION, STATE OF THE ART, THEORY

Utilization

The fact that instructional films are being used more widely than ever before (Hoban, 1971) suggests that questions should be asked about how they are being used, how they should be used, and how effective is this use. Parker (1970) advocated an approach called Instructional Film Systems for the proper exploitation of motion pictures in education. The six major aspects of the system are:

1. Information-Message or Instructional Module: material that should require the viewer to act

2. The Delivery System: an arrangement that is responsive to the needs of individual viewers

3. Feedback and Reinforcement: programmed materials that interface with the filmed presentation

4. Opportunity to Practice Newly Acquired Skills: a function designed into the system

5. Evaluation by Instructor of Acquired Behavior: particular behavioral objectives

6. Evaluation (of System) and Revision.

When film is perceived not only as a medium <u>through</u> which teaching is done, but also as a medium that can be taught <u>about</u> and that people can be taught to <u>be creative</u> in (Worth, 1974), the opportunities for imaginative utilization increase dramatically. Hodgekinson (1970) and Powell (1971) reported their participation in a specially-funded two-year program in North Reading, Massachusetts, where filmmaking and film study were integrated into the regular secondary school curriculum so successfully that the local district has chosen to continue these activities with local funding. Film literacy was supported by Forsdale and Forsdale as a proper objective of schooling, maintaining that "film is not an 'automatic' medium, that comprehension is little more guaranteed when a viewer looks at a screen than when a reader looks at a printed page." (1971:271)

An art educator has advocated research in student creative use of "non-discursive" media (Eisner, 1971). Instructors in a high school psychology course have reported that the use of feature length films furnishes appropriate material for the course and motivates their

students (Duckworth and Hoover-Suczek, 1976). High school filmmaking activities have been surveyed and found to be extensive (Hyman, 1974).

State-of-the Art

Although he saw the resistance of teachers to change as a boundary to the state-of-the-art of films, Hoban (1971) declared certain trends and developments to be significant.

1. Larger film libraries on the school system level with state film libraries serving back-up functions.

2. Super-8 millimeter, film loops, automatic threading, better screens, rear projection.

3. Miniaturization for utilization by small groups and individuals.

4. Single concept cassette film loops as a part of programmed instruction and individually prescribed instruction.

5. Computerized film production for the visualization of abstract material such as wave theory in engineering.

In an updating of these trends, Hoban (1975) added three major developments.

1. New instructional films of much better quality that are more subtle in their didacticism.

2. Film study in the curriculum.

3. Filmmaking in the curriculum.

Theory

Hoban (1971) pointed out several significant developments in film theory: Marshall McLuhan's theories of media, Worth and Adair's

study of Navajos making film, single and multiple channel transmission theory, and the effects of teacher expectation on pupil performance.

Sol Worth (1974) offered a logical and positive statement about film as communication and cognitive experience. He resisted the view that the visual experience is primary, that the verbal mode is inferior, that good film can be ingested whole without cognition.

> It is literally inconceivable that one mode of symbolic thought operates with a presented universe that arrives ready-made to man's brain, while other modes somehow require the mind to manipulate and to structure. Film, like verbal language, like gesture, mathematics, music, painting, and dance, is a method by which different people articulate their experience and present themselves to one another. (1974:297)

Worth explained that the purpose of the filmmaker is to communicate feelings, concepts, attitudes, facts, or values and that this must be done by making implications with the medium. Consequently, the viewer must make inferences from the medium in order to receive the communication; the viewer must participate cognitively in the process, not just passively allow undiscriminated stimuli to impinge upon sense receptors and enter consciousness and memory without being decoded and restructured.

> Film offers a new means or mode of cognition and communication that stands parallel to the established modes; hence, it does not deny the intellectual, creative, and social values upon which our society is based. Giving up the dependence on words alone does not necessitate throwing out either verbal language or the cognitive skills associated with the ability to speak, read, or write. (1974:292)

FILM: EXPERIMENTAL RESEARCH

Experimental research in instructional film began almost as soon as the medium itself. The research from 1918 to 1950 was reported and generalized by Hoban and van Ormer (1950). Five Values of Instructional

Films, based on thirty-two years of research by a variety of investigators, were stated as follows:

Value 1: People learn from films.

Value 2: When effective and appropriate films are properly used, people learn more in less time and are better able to retain what they have learned.

Value 3: Instructional films may stimulate other learning activities.

Value 4: Certain films may facilitate thinking and problem solving.

Value 5: Appropriate films are equivalent to at least an average teacher, and sometimes even to an excellent instructor insofar as the instructor's function is communicating the facts or demonstrating the procedures presented in the film. (1950:9-1&2)

Also in this major basic summary, Instructional Film Research 1918-1950, Hoban and van Ormer stated ten important principles that determine the influence of films.

I. Principle of Reinforcement. The greatest influence of films is in reinforcing and extending motivations, knowledge, and attitudes already present to some degree in the audience.

II. Principle of Specificity. The specific influence of a film is greater than its general influence.

III. Principle of Relevance. A film is more influential when its content is directly concerned with specifically desired outcomes in terms of audience reaction.

IV. Principle of Audience Variability. The factors among the audience that cause their reactions to vary are film literacy, intelligence, education, age, sex, prior experience with the content, and prejudice for or against the content.

V. Principle of Visual Primacy. The effectiveness of a film is primarily a function of its visual excellence, the influence of its narration being only secondary.

VI. Principle of Pictorial Context. An audience reacts most fundamentally to the things in the visual context of the film which seem familiar and relevant to the action taking place in that context.

VII. Principle of Subjectivity. The most efficient responses to film occur when audiences identify with persons in the film and when filming techniques allow them a subjective viewpoint.

VIII. Principle of Rate of Development. If material is presented too rapidly, learning will decrease.

IX. Principle of Instructional Variables. When good instructional procedures are either built into the film or practiced by the teacher showing the film, the instructional effectiveness of the film will be improved.

X. Principle of Instructor Leadership. To the extent that the instructor is a good leader, the learning of the class from the film will be more effective.

Miller (1957) listed a similar set of principles for optimal learning from film. These principles were expressed in relation to four variables involved in teaching and learning -- drive, cue, response, and reward -- that seem especially amenable to the film approach. Film is an appropriate motivator of interest (drive) and an efficient presenter of a wide array of stimuli (cue). Film also can be used effectively to initiate student activity (response) and to satisfy the student's desire for resolution (reward).

McKeachie (1966:270) described principles that had emerged regarding the use of films in instruction and made reference to specific pieces of research that supported these principles.

1. Students can learn from films, and usually do learn at least as much as from a poor teacher (VanderMeer, 1950).
2. Such learning is not confined to details, but may include concepts and attitudes (Hoban and van Ormer, 1950; Kishler, 1950; Mertens, 1951).
3. Outline materials such as titles and commentary increase learning if a film is not well organized (Northrop, 1952).
4. For less intelligent students, repeating the film increases learning (McTavish, 1949).
5. Students learn how to learn from films; i.e. students with previous experience with instructional films learn more than students without previous experience (VanderMeer, 1951).
6. Presenting pictures is more effective than presenting words as stimuli in rote association tasks such as learning a foreign language (Kopstein and Roshal, 1954; May and Lumsdaine, 1958).
7. Participation increases learning (Hovland, Lumsdaine, and Sheffield, 1949).

Reid and MacLennan (1967) listed 333 experiments in instructional television and film, complete with descriptive abstracts of each study. This summary covers the research in the period following the Hoban-van Ormer work of 1950 and contains an introduction, "Review of Trends in Research on Instructional Television and Film," by Greenhill, who makes a number of generalizations based on an examination of the collected research information.

1. A general pattern of no significant differences emerged when filmed instruction was compared with conventional instruction.

2. Filmed instruction has the advantage of taking less time.

3. Filmed instruction has the advantage of putting competent instruction into a classroom where none was available.

4. Some films of actual classroom teaching have proved to be significantly more effective in teacher education than traditional approaches to the same content.

5. Repetition of films, up to a point, increases learning.

6. Practice with film by learners increases its effectiveness for them.

7. Undelayed feedback to the student as to the correctness of his responses to questions following a film appears to improve learning.

8. Pertinent content in films will alter attitudes that are related to the course.

9. No special film production techniques have been developed that consistently produce differences in learning that are clearly significant.

10. Further research should be conducted in the area of planning and synthesizing stimulus materials and in channeling the responses of students in carefully defined ways. General comparisons among presentation modes will probably not be productive.

Miller (1969) compared the effects of a film and its counterpart restructured as a filmograph (non-moving single frames accompanied by the same soundtrack; in effect, a filmstrip). There were no significant differences in information recall.

Allen (1971) observed that, starting in the mid-50's, experimental research shifted from instructional film to instructional television. This switch coincided with legislation assigning television channels to education.

In a summary of some research on instructional film, Kalkofen (1972) concluded that verbal tests were not the most appropriate method for the evaluation of filmed instruction. He advocated the use of testing instruments embodied in the same medium that was used for instruction.

Campeau (1974) surveyed research on teaching adults with instructional media. This investigation covered the period 1966-1971 and turned up no experimental studies of film that met all screening criteria. As a result, the conclusions about instructional film were drawn from other summaries, including the one of instructional television research by Chu and Schramm (1975) and the summaries by Reid and MacLennan (1967) and McKeachie (1966).

Allen (1973) looked at fifty years of research in educational media and found that contemporary researchers seemed less interested in broad comparisons of the effects of different media than in determining which student organismic factors interact with media to make them more or less effective as instructional materials and techniques. Following up on this interest, Allen (1975) inferred generalizations from his examination of studies of this kind that cover the field of instructional media; but his first two generalizations are particularly pertinent to the present study.

> 1. There is no apparent support for the supposition that individuals of higher mental ability may learn more from verbal treatments and those of lower ability from pictorial treatments.
>
> 1.1 Individuals of higher mental ability may benefit proportionately more from presentations by perceptionally complex, fixed-pace, information-laden, multi-channel motion pictorial forms (motion pictures and television) than will those individuals of lower mental ability. (1975:142-143)

FILM AND LITERATURE

Film has been widely considered to be appropriate matter for serious study in the English classroom for approximately twenty years. Fulton (1960) published an early study that contains chapters comparing plays to film versions of them, novels to film versions, and short

stories to film versions. Bluestone (1961) laid the foundation for all future literature/film comparisons with his seminal work Novels into Film. Other major basic works in this area were by Richardson (1969) and Magny (1972). A specialized periodical, Literature/Film Quarterly, that is devoted to literature/film comparisons, has been published for several years.

Evidence of the growing interest in film by leaders in the teaching of English is apparent in a number of publications by the National Council of Teachers of English (NCTE). The publication of The Motion Picture and the Teaching of English by Sheridan and others (1965) was underwritten by the NCTE and includes a statement of the rationale for the use of film in English courses.

> There are many reasons why we have considered the role of the moving picture in the teaching of English. First, the film has an unparalleled power to transmit information and inferences. Second, it may illuminate and augment the study of literature. Third, it has form, structure, theme, irony, metaphor, and symbol -- aspects of any work of art, and hence, subject to examination and isolation. And finally, it is concerned with ethics, values, and truth -- which may be embodied or distorted in films as in any other medium. (1965: viii)

The first Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) Reading and Communication Skills Clearinghouse report on films in English courses was published in English Journal (Denby, 1969). Further reports were made at two-year intervals (Kirkton, 1971; Isaacson, 1973) with the emphasis as reflected in the studies reported shifting from the use of film to transmit conventional English course content to the use of film as a proper object of study in itself (film study) and as a medium for creative student activity (filmmaking). The use of film in English courses had become so common by 1974 that an entire issue of English Journal was dedicated to the subject, and some teachers were beginning

to feel it necessary to respond to criticism that perhaps film study and filmmaking were not providing students with the verbal activities they needed.

> . . .There is no necessary incompatibility between the periodic cries for "media" in education and the periodic cries for "literacy," "skills," and "accountability." In fact, we believe that media production offers a necessary and fruitful perspective on print skills -- not a retreat from them. (Morrow and Suid, 1974:38)

Sohn (1968) advocated the literature/film comparison study as a way of integrating film into the classroom. Katz (1969) described a ten-week, eleventh grade unit put into practice in Canada that used film study and filmmaking in English classes. Silva (1969) supported English teachers as probably best equipped to teach film study courses but opposed the comparison of literature and film adaptations of literature at least until the student has been thoroughly grounded in film as a separate art form. Arrowsmith (1969) described film as not just a medium for the presentation of curriculum but rather as curriculum itself.

Schwartz (1971) urged the use of film in the elementary and junior high schools to introduce and illustrate basic literary concepts such as point of view, plot, character, setting, tone, and author's intention. Johnson (1971) stated that English teachers should use film the way they use literature, to help students to find their identities and to understand themselves better.

Holladay (1973), in studying film utilization by college English teachers, described five kinds of use to which film was put.

1. Film as Motivation.
2. Comparative or Cross-Media Study.

3. Film as Literature and/or Drama.

4. Film and Poetry.

5. Instructional Films.

Buzzard (1973) studied the humanizing effect film could have on the secondary English curriculum. He supported many changes (teachers' objectives, attitudes, classroom behavior) to accompany greater use of electronic media in the classroom, aimed at promoting individualized instruction for students whose interests and abilities vary more today, perhaps, than ever before.

Anderson (1975) explored three major areas of film study as a foundation for curriculum.

1. The proliferation of materials and courses of study in film.

2. The synthesis of a foundation for the study of film.

3. The building of a curricular framework to demonstrate film's function in curriculum development.

Niemi (1976) explored the possibility of using the same response-centered approach to teaching in secondary film education that has created much interest as an approach to the teaching of literature.

Felheim (1975) supplied a substantial reason for making the literature/film comparison a viable approach to the study of literature by pointing out that each new version of an original work in another genre can be apprehended as another critical reading of the first version, shedding light and adding perspective.

FILM AND READING: RESEARCH

Witty and Fitzwater (1953) studied second grade students in six Chicago schools for one semester. For the first half of the semester

these students were taught with basal readers and conventional techniques; for the second half they were taught with films, readers especially designed to function with the films, and activities that featured the students' recording their own oral readings of the selections on the magnetic sound tracks of the films. Using three forms of The California Reading Test, the students were pre-tested at the beginning of the semester, post-tested at the end of the first half, and post-tested at the end of the semester. Using grade equivalents, the investigators compared reading growth during the first half of the semester to reading growth during the second half. Five of the nine classes indicated greater gains in the experimental period, with the other four classes indicating equal gains.

May and Jenkinson (1953) showed one group of 235 high school freshmen English students a twenty-eight minute condensed film version of Stevenson's Kidnapped. Another group of 245 students from the same grade level were shown an eighteen minute "motivational" film that contained excerpts from the first film. Following the film presentations the group that viewed the condensed version checked more copies of the book out of the library than did the group that viewed the shorter "motivational" production. There was no significant difference at the .05 level between evidence of the two groups' actually reading the book. Boys in the "motivational" group, however, read significantly more of the novel than boys in the other group.

Levinson (1963) studied the effect of viewing film versions of short stories on the reading of the stories. Three groups were formed from 452 junior high school students. One group read four short stories; another group read the short stories then viewed film versions of them;

the third group viewed the films then read the stories. One story presentation was made each week for four weeks with an investigator-made test on each story following the presentation immediately. Analysis of variance showed that the responses to reading alone and the reading-viewing combinations were significantly different, with the reading-viewing means being higher. There was no significant difference between reading then viewing and viewing then reading.

Lewis (1972) compared the responses of tenth grade students to narrative and lyric literature and film. The students, from four secondary schools, read a short story and a lyric poem and viewed two films that were not film versions of the story and poem but that had been paired with these literary selections. All students were exposed to all materials, and then the students made open-ended responses to them. These responses were categorized and tallied under the following headings: literary judgments, interpretational responses, narrational reactions, associational responses, self-involvement, prescriptive judgments, and miscellaneous. An analysis of variance and a multivariate analysis were used in the comparison of the responses to film and literature and to the lyric and narrative types, tested at the .05 level. Three of the results of this study follow.

1. Tenth grade students <u>interpret</u> film more than they do literature.

2. Tenth grade students <u>narrate</u> literature more than they do film.

3. Tenth grade students respond differently to film from the way they respond to literature in the categories of interpretation, narration, self-involvement, and prescription.

In a year long study by Dech (1975), three eighth grade groups (1) viewed story-related films in conjunction with the study of a basal reader, (2) used the reader alone, and (3) used non-story related films with the reader. No significant differences were found among the groups, using pre-tests and post-tests with the Gates-MacGinitie Survey E, forms 1 and 3, comprehension and vocabulary sections.

More recent research in the comparison of viewing and reading has been involved with areas other than literature. Including 249 students from three colleges in a study, Hoachlander (1976) divided them into three groups. S_1 viewed a forty-five minute videocassette from The Ascent of Man series and took a thirty-five minute test on it. S_2 were given forty-five minutes to read the chapter from the textbook that the television episode was based on and then given the same thirty-five minute test. S_3 were given no content at all, through either videocassette or textbook, but received the same post-test. A comparison of the means of the scores of the reading and viewing groups showed no statistically significant difference.

Dividing twenty-four classes of college students in a basic education course into four treatment groups, Brady (1976) used three kinds of stimulus media together with a student guidebook and a printed overview. The T_1 group used printed scripts; T_2, sixteen millimeter film; T_3, slide-audiotape with a discussion component; and T_4, slide-audiotape with no discussion component. A filmed pre-test and a filmed post-test were used as dependent measures. Using a multivariate analysis of variance and covariance, no statistically significant differences were found at the .05 level among the means of the groups.

LISTENING: RESEARCH AND PRACTICE

In surveying major research findings in listening for the period 1950-1960, Keller (1960) reported on several studies.

1. Brown and Carlsen found only small correlations between their test of listening comprehension and tests of reading comprehension.

2. Blewett concluded that listening and reading employ different factors.

3. Stromer found instruction that improved listening comprehension did not significantly improve reading comprehension.

4. Biggs felt her diagnostic listening test measured different traits from those measured by diagnostic reading tests.

Russell (1964) examined research that had been recently conducted. This summary reported that studies of correlations between listening and reading indicate the presence of listening abilities that are separate from but related to other verbal abilities. Brown's theory of listening was also reported, especially his use of the term auding to mean comprehending verbal material by listening and his concept of a hierarchical relationship among the terms hearing, listening, and auding, as comparable to seeing, observing, and reading. Russell suggested more research should be performed that would study classroom listening situations, probe the interrelationships among all verbal skills, and explore the possibilities of curricular innovations that would integrate language development programs.

In an NCTE/ERIC report on listening, Denby (1969) described a study by Stodola and others in which a listening comprehension test was administered by teacher-readers, by sound film, and by audiotape

recordings with no significant differences found among the presentation groups.

In a hortatory article that included a twenty-five entry bibliography, Elin (1972) urged elementary language arts teachers to place a new emphasis on listening skills.

Gratz (1973) described three minicourses in listening that were taught for three weeks each in a required high school sophomore English course. All three minicourses aimed at improving attentive, critical, and creative listening; and one of them involved the listening by students to recordings of literary selections.

LaRocque (1976) advocated the oral reading of pieces of literature by the teacher to students on grounds that it allows a more relaxed tempo and makes student comprehension more likely.

> Reading aloud -- poetry, short stories, novels, articles -- is a strategy calculated to reduce the pace and to make the listener a lover of books. It is part of the oral tradition that goes back to Homer but which seems to have been discarded because it is slower than the silent reading which allows the reader to "cover more ground." Even the brightest twelfth grade students like to be read to, especially if the material is difficult, because the oral interpretation and the reader's voice pattern help to sort out the meaning. (1976:32)

The most comprehensive source of information on the large body of research in listening is the 1332-item annotated bibliography by Duker (1968). A useful supplement to this collection is the ten-page unannotated bibliography by Schubach (1976). A question that runs through all of this research with theme-like repetition is whether or not there is an actual high correlation between reading ability and listening skill.

Vineyard and Bailey (1960) used the reading scores on the Cooperative English Test, the listening scores on the Listening Test of the STEP, and the intelligence scores on the American Council on Education

Psychological Examination of 114 freshmen college students to check for possible relationships between listening, reading, and intelligence. This study showed a reading-listening correlation of .708, a reading-intelligence correlation of .758, and a listening-intelligence correlation of .671.

Devine (1967) reported three studies that showed no relationship between instruction in listening and improved reading scores. This article suggests that further correlational studies between reading and listening might be delayed until instruments have been developed that can measure pure listening ability.

Hollingsworth (1968) asserted that listening and reading have high positive correlations and involve about the same mental processes.

Duker (1971) listed and summarized twenty-three studies of correlations between scores on listening and reading tests. The coefficients ranged from .45 to .70, with a mean of .59. One of the inferences that Duker concludes from these statistics is that, although it is often assumed that poor readers will benefit more from instruction that involves listening than good readers will, the poor reader will probably be inferior in listening also.

LISTENING AND READING: RESEARCH

Day and Beach (1950) surveyed thirty-four major studies that had compared visual and aural information presentations. One half of the research favored the visual and one half the auditory mode, with specific circumstances determining which was superior. An analysis by Day and Beach of these studies developed eleven generalizations about influential factors in student comprehension in the two modes.

1. Visual and aural combined are more efficient than either alone.

2. Familiar material is better presented in the auditory mode; unfamiliar material is better in a visual presentation.

3. The more intelligent the receiver, the more relatively advantageous is the visually presented material.

4. When the reading ability of the student is higher, the visually presented material is relatively more effective.

5. The effectiveness of visually presented material increases from an inferior position for six year olds to a possibly superior position for sixteen year olds.

6. A visual presentation is more effective for very difficult material, and an auditory presentation is better understood for very easy material.

7. A visual presentation is favored for immediate recall, and an auditory presentation when the test is delayed for a considerable period.

8. The longer the period of delay, the less efficient the visual presentation.

9. The greatest advantage of visual presentation lies in its referability. If there is little or no referability, the visual mode loses its advantage.

10. The auditory presentation is better for prose or factual information; the visual mode is better for code and other loosely related materials.

11. Measures of learning work more effectively with the visual mode, measures of retention with the aural mode.

Durrell (1969) described the results when equated forms of reading and listening tests were administered to students in grades one through eight, with standardized populations of three to four thousand students at each grade level. In the vocabulary section of the tests, the first grade listening vocabulary score was twice the reading vocabulary score; but there was a progressive increase in reading vocabulary through the grades to the eighth grade, when the reading and listening vocabulary scores tended to be equal. In the paragraph reading/listening section of the tests, the first grade listening score was approximately twice the reading score; but reading improved through the grades to the sixth grade, when the scores were equal. Reading paragraph scores were greater than listening paragraph scores in the seventh grade with a further widening of the difference in the eighth grade.

Studies Showing an Advantage for Reading

Corey (1934) compared the achievement of college students who attended lectures and college students who read the lecture material. Those who read the material performed better on tests given immediately, but there was no significant difference between the groups on delayed tests. Students with higher intelligence scores did relatively better by reading than by attending lectures.

Smith (1959) administered the McCall Crabbe passages to 180 students divided into three groups: a group that read the printed passages, a group that listened to the passages read orally, and a group that listened to and read the passages. The reading group performed most efficiently, while the combination group was second. No significant differences were found among students with low intelligence scores.

Many (1965) compared two groups of sixth grade students, one of which read selected material, including a short story, and one of which listened to the same material. The visual presentation proved to be superior in terms of student scores on post-tests.

Studies Showing an Advantage for Listening

England (1953) divided seventy fifth grade students into a reading group and a listening group. The listening group performed better than the reading group on both overall comprehension and recall of details.

Hampleman (1955) worked with fourth and sixth grade students in a comparison of listening and reading comprehension ability. Listening comprehension was found to be superior in both fourth and sixth grades. The difference between the two modes was found to decrease, however, as mental ages increased.

Hannah (1961) found that college freshmen who listened to narrative material comprehended it better than when they read the print version. Descriptive material, however, was more effective when the material was read silently.

Maberry (1976) compared the effectiveness of three methods of presenting short stories: silent reading, listening to a solo reading performance, and readers theater. Ninth and eleventh grade students from existing classes in a private high school, an urban public high school, and a rural public high school participated in the study, a total of 371 students. Three short stories were used, and each class of students was exposed to all three stories and all three presentation modes, followed by investigator-constructed post-tests. This procedure

necessitated the pooling of scores to form presentation mode groups, since each class was involved in all three modes in order to equalize these groups. Analysis of variance showed that readers theater was significantly more effective than solo reading performance and that solo reading performance was significantly more effective than silent reading, all at the .01 level of confidence.

Studies Showing No Significant Difference

Carver (1935) worked with ninety-one subjects in a pioneer study of the relative effectiveness of visual and aural presentation. No significant differences were found.

Emslie, Kelleher, and Leonard (1954) presented eight stories to 132 fourth grade students over four sessions. At each session the students read one story silently and listened to one story read orally. No significant differences in comprehension were found between the presentation modes, but superior readers performed better in reading than in listening, and inferior readers performed better in listening than reading.

Gray (1958) studied the presentations of two poems by oral reading and two poems in print form to forty-eight college students. There were no significant differences in comprehension between the two methods. Campbell (1960), in a similar study with seventy-two college students, found that, while silent reading was superior to oral interpretation for retention, there was no significant difference in comprehension between the two modes.

Jones (1963) presented oral and printed material to 249 college students. Using an investigator-constructed test, Jones discovered no

significant differences between the two presentation methods in the reasoning performances of the students.

Swalm (1972) compared the effectiveness in evoking student comprehension of three techniques: oral reading by the students, silent reading, and listening to audiotapes. Three stories, one for each grade level, were used with 324 second, third, and fourth grade students. No significant differences were found among the three large groups, but second grade students did significantly better with oral reading than with both silent reading and listening, and above average readers did better reading silently than listening.

In an experimental study by Young (1973) using ninety college freshmen and sophomores, the rates of presentation of both print and recorded readings were maintained at precisely the same number of words per minute. The rate of presenting the print was controlled by projecting it from sixteen millimeter motion picture film at 175 words per minute, the same rate at which readers recorded the audio material used. With two experimental groups and a control group, one experimental group listened to fourteen messages and took a six-item test on each message; the other experimental group read the projected print messages and took the same tests; the control group read the messages from printed pages at their own individual rates and also took the same tests. There were no significant differences among the scores of the three groups.

Breiter (1975) studied silent reading and listening to audiotapes of commercial learning materials by 570 sixth grade students, 296 male and 274 female. Eight subgroups were established: (1) above average I.Q., (2) average I.Q., (3) below average I.Q., (4) above average reading ability, (5) average reading ability, (6) below average reading

ability, (7) male, and (8) female. Analysis of covariance was used, with a pretest as the covariate; and the hypotheses were tested at the .05 level. Most of the relationships indicated no significant difference between reading and listening as effective techniques of instruction. Children with above average I.Q.'s, however, learned more efficiently by reading than listening; and reading was more effective for sixth grade girls than listening.

FILM, LISTENING, AND READING: RESEARCH

Wetstone and Friedlander (1974) divided 247 kindergarten, first grade, second grade, and third grade students into three groups to compare their comprehension of two narrated stories presented in three ways: (1) live, (2) videotape, and (3) audiotape. The questions of the criterion instrument followed the stories immediately and were in the same presentation mode as the stories for each group. The only statistically significant difference uncovered by analysis of variance (at the .005 level) was between videotape and audiotape, with the videotape group having a higher mean score.

Phair (1976) regrouped randomly ninety-two sixth grade students from four classes in two schools into four presentation mode groups for social studies subject matter: (1) a film with sound, (2) the film soundtrack only, (3) a print version of the soundtrack, and (4) a sound filmstrip using the soundtrack and single frame pictures from the film. On a post-test constructed by the investigator, the film and filmstrip proved to support learning more efficiently than either the soundtrack or the print version, and the print version was more effective than the aural mode.

Chapter 3

DESIGN AND PROCEDURES

Important elements in the design and procedure of this study were (1) the selection of short stories and films, (2) the recording of oral readings of the stories, (3) the selection of a standardized reading test, (4) the construction of achievement tests, and (5) the selection of schools, teachers, and students. An account of the performance of the experiment is also related in this chapter, which concludes with a concise statement of the research design.

SELECTION OF SHORT STORIES AND FILMS

The criteria established by the investigator for the selection of the short stories used in this study were:

1. that the stories be currently taught on a regular basis in eleventh grade level English courses in the school system where the experiment was to be carried out
2. that film versions of the stories be available
3. that the stories be of varying lengths
4. that the stories be representative of several literary periods.

The four stories selected were Edgar Allan Poe's "The Tell-Tale Heart," Nathaniel Hawthorne's "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment," Jack London's "To Build a Fire," and Shirley Jackson's "The Lottery." All of these stories are included in literature anthologies that were in use in East

Baton Rouge Parish in eleventh grade English classes at the time of the study (Gehlmann and Bowman, 1958; Fuller and Kinnick, 1963); and an informal poll of the six teachers who participated in the study indicated that they had planned to present these stories to their students before they knew of their participation in the study.

The film versions of all four stories were available at the time of the study in the film library of the school system media center.

The stories chosen vary considerably in length:

1. "The Tell-Tale Heart": 2200 words
2. "The Lottery": 3500 words
3. "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment": 3800 words
4. "To Build a Fire": 7000 words.

The selected stories represent three periods in American literature:

1. the romanticism of the first half of the nineteenth century: "The Tell-Tale Heart" and "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment"
2. late nineteenth century realism: "To Build a Fire"
3. the post-World War II mid-century period: "The Lottery."

The criteria established by the investigator for the selection of the films used in the study were:

1. that the films be available for classroom use by teachers in the school system
2. that the original short story versions of the films be available
3. that the films represent several production styles and be the products of several distributors

4. that the films be recently produced

5. that each of the films be thirty minutes or less in length.

All four films were available from the East Baton Rouge Parish Schools Media Center film library to any teacher in the system at the time of the study, as were the print versions in several widely-used literature anthologies.

While "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" (1973) and "The Lottery" (1972) were adapted, produced, and directed by one filmmaker, Larry Yust, and distributed by Encyclopaedia Britannica Educational Corporation, they were made with very different technical and artistic emphases. "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" was filmed entirely on interior sets with a subjective approach that used an opulence of dissolves, superimpositions, quick cuts, time lapse photography, extreme close-ups, slow motion, and a camera that tracked orbitally around central scenes of intense action. "The Lottery" was filmed entirely out of doors with an approach that was almost documentary in its objectivity. "The Tell-Tale Heart" (1973), distributed by the Learning Corporation of America, used the kinestasis technique of photographing a series of artist's renderings of the imagery of the story, accompanied by a voice-over narrated by the English actor James Mason. BFA Educational Media distributed "To Build a Fire" (1976), which, because of the fact that the one character journeys alone with his dog throughout the story, placed much emphasis on the voice-over, which consisted of the reading of passages from the text of the story by American actor Leonard Nimoy. EBEC, Learning Corporation, and BFA were cooperative in lending prints of these films to the investigator for use in the study.

Since class periods in East Baton Rouge high schools are fifty minutes long, the films were required to have running times of less than thirty minutes each so that a fifteen-minute test could follow in the same class session. The running times of the selected films are:

1. "The Tell-Tale Heart": 8 minutes
2. "The Lottery": 18 minutes
3. "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment": 22 minutes
4. "To Build a Fire": 14¼ minutes

RECORDING THE READINGS OF THE STORIES

The oral readings of the short stories were recorded on audio-cassettes by a male secondary school English teacher, other than the investigator, who read from the same textbooks that were used by the students in the silent reading group. The running times of these recordings were:

1. "The Tell-Tale Heart": 15 minutes
2. "The Lottery": 24 minutes
3. "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment": 25 minutes
4. "To Build a Fire": 45 minutes.

SELECTION OF THE STANDARDIZED READING TEST

Five criteria established by the investigator were used in the selection of a standardized reading test to obtain the covariate for the data analysis:

1. reliability
2. validity
3. recentness of development

4. inclusion of minority groups in the norm group

5. procedures for rejecting culturally biased items.

The Comprehensive Tests of Basic Skills (1975), Reading Vocabulary and Reading Comprehension sections, was chosen in order to use its Total Reading score as covariate in analysis of covariance to hold all groups equal in reading ability. According to the technical bulletin accompanying the CTBS, the Reading Vocabulary section has a Kuder-Richardson 20 reliability of .92 for tenth grade, seventh month, and for eleventh grade, seventh month. The Reading Comprehension section has a Kuder-Richardson 20 reliability of .91 for both tenth grade, seventh month and eleventh grade, seventh month. In Total Reading the Kuder-Richardson 20 is .95 for both levels. The standard error of measurement for the Total Reading score was 3.94 for tenth grade, seventh month, and 3.90 for eleventh grade, seventh month, with standard deviations of 18.23 and 17.58, respectively.

The best evidence of the content validity of the CTBS reading sections is the table of specifications in the CTBS Test Coordinator's Handbook, which places all of the test items in cells intersected by Process (Recognition/Application, Translation, Interpretation, Analysis) and Content (Recall of Synonym, Literal Recall, Re-Wording, Context Clues, Main Idea, Descriptive Words, Conclusion, Structure/Style). Buros's Mental Measurements Yearbook (1972:1074-1975) refers to this table.

> The main value, then, of the intellectual process classification is that it aided in constructing a test which measures a variety of educationally significant processes.

The Buros article also states that the CTBS reading test is "a model of good test construction" and "is probably a highly valid test for its purpose." (Buros, 1972:1075).

The CTBS technical bulletin reports that the CTBS was normed in April, 1973, with 11,180 students in the tenth grade, 1,029 in the eleventh grade, and 32,956 in all of Level 4 (eighth through twelfth grades). Subjects were used from all fifty states and from all socio-economic backgrounds, and sampling techniques assured proportionate representation of minorities.

Two procedures were used to reject culturally biased items. Black and Spanish-speaking teachers and curriculum specialists editorially reviewed the test and rejected or revised any items that were detected to contain bias against these minority groups. The second procedure involved a field test of the instrument, followed by point biserial correlations of the performance of a black group and a "standard" group on each item. Any item with a point biserial of less than .20 for either group was discarded.

CONSTRUCTION OF ACHIEVEMENT TESTS

The series of investigator-constructed achievement tests on the four short stories was based on a table of specifications (See Appendix) designed with content that includes (1) characterization, (2) setting, (3) plot, (4) dialogue, (5) viewpoint, (6) theme, and (7) irony. The total of eighty-eight items operate on the behavioral levels of knowledge, comprehension, analysis, and evaluation. The complete set of tests is included in the Appendix.

A pilot study of these tests was conducted on August 2-3, 1976, using students in the East Baton Rouge Parish Summer School at Istrouma High School. Recorded readings were used as the mode of presentation in all cases, followed immediately by the test. Re-tests, using the same

instruments with the same students, were accomplished the following day to obtain data for test-retest reliability.

Garrett's Formula (29) (1966:142), for the calculation of r from raw scores when deviations are taken from zero, was employed to arrive at coefficients of stability for the four tests. Three of the tests demonstrated coefficients of .80 or better; only one, the test for "To Build a Fire," produced a lower coefficient: .64.

	Number of Students	r
"The Tell-Tale Heart"	6	.80
"The Lottery"	8	.84
"To Build a Fire"	8	.64
"Dr. Heidegger's Experiment"	9	.83

Data from the first pilot administration of the tests were used in an item analysis to detect negatively discriminating items. Two items in the "To Build a Fire" test (two and twenty-three) and two items in the "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" test (sixteen and twenty-three) were determined to be discriminating negatively. The two number twenty-three items, being the last items in their respective tests, were removed. The interior items were allowed to remain in the tests but were not included in the scoring.

	No. of Students	Items Discr. Positively	Items Not Discr.	Items Discr. Negatively
"The Tell-Tale Heart"	9	16	7	0
"The Lottery"	14	20	3	0
"To Build a Fire"	10	17	4	2
"Dr. Heidegger's Experiment"	13	20	1	2

The pilot study also established the fact that no students took longer than fifteen minutes to complete any of the four tests; consequently, students were allowed fifteen minutes to take each short story test during the main study.

SELECTION OF SCHOOLS, TEACHERS, AND STUDENTS: THE SAMPLE

Before the study was begun, permission was received from the Assistant Superintendent, Instruction, of the East Baton Rouge Parish Public Schools to work in selected secondary schools of the system. Consultations followed with the Director of Secondary Education, the Director of Research and Program Evaluation, the Director of Research and Curriculum Development, the Director of Federal Programs, and the Supervisor of English and Humanities.

Nine secondary schools were selected from the list made available by school board office staff members of all the secondary schools in the East Baton Rouge system, with their total school populations and the percentage of students in each attendance district eligible for the free lunch program. Using proximity in the ranked percentages of free lunch eligible students and similarity in size as guides, three schools were selected as representative of low socioeconomic areas, all of them with more than 35.2% of the children in the attendance district eligible for free lunch. These schools were eligible for funds from Title I of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act because of the fact that more than 35.2% of the children were eligible for the free lunch program. Three other schools were selected as having middle range socioeconomic attendance districts because over 10% but not over 35.2% of the children in

these areas were eligible for free lunch. A third cluster of three schools was chosen as having high socioeconomic attendance districts because fewer than 10% of the children in these zones were eligible for the free lunch program. Two schools were selected from each cluster of three by drawing a slip of paper from among three with the schools' names on them and discarding the school drawn. This procedure was followed for each of the socioeconomic levels. Six schools were chosen, as a result, to participate in the study, two from each of the three socioeconomic levels.

	Number Enrolled	Percentage Eligible for Free Lunch in District
McKinley High	1,206	71.7
Scotlandville High	1,185	65.7
Baker High	1,640	20.5
Glen Oaks High	1,329	19.5
Belaire High	1,512	5.4
Woodlawn High	1,180	4.9

Conferences were arranged with the principals of the six schools. At these meetings either the principal or the assistant principal for instruction selected an English teacher from the faculty to participate in the study. Those teachers who were selected taught relatively large numbers of eleventh grade students. Conferences with the chosen English teachers followed immediately, and three classes of each teacher were selected. The classes chosen had high percentages of students classified as eleventh graders. Picking classes in this fashion was necessary because of the prevalent English phase elective program that mixed different grade levels in the same classes. The investigator drew slips of paper

to determine how the three classes of each teacher would be assigned to the three presentation mode groups, for each teacher had one class that read all four stories, one class that viewed all four films, and one class that listened to all four recordings. This aspect of the design of the study was an attempt to neutralize the possibly confounding variable of teacher ability by giving each teacher an influence on each of the presentation mode groups.

With eighteen classes taught by six teachers from three different kinds of schools, the original expectation had been that this stratified sample would produce numbers of usable scores and covariates on the order of 125 to 150 for each of the large presentation mode groups. Because of a high rate of absenteeism, the mixture of tenth and twelfth graders in the classes, and the fact that each student had to be present on all of six or seven specific days to be included in the study, this expectation was not realized. The actual usable numbers for the across-the-board presentation groups were:

1. reading 66
2. listening 75
3. viewing 60.

The fact that the usable scores are those of 201 eleventh grade students who attended every presentation and testing session while the scores of 191 of their eleventh grade classmates are not usable because of one or more absences must be taken into account when considering the results.

PERFORMANCE OF THE EXPERIMENT

In the original conferences with principals, assistant principals, and teachers, each interested party was furnished with a one-page digest

of the purpose and nature of the study, including a description of the activities and the class periods required (see Appendix). On the second visit to the schools, the investigator explained orally to the teachers the importance of adhering without deviation to the schedule for presentation and testing, of not discussing any of the material or tests with the students until all of the presentations and tests were completed, and of following exactly the detailed written directions for presentations and test administration that would be furnished to them (see Appendix). A two-page letter listing these and other important points in maintaining the integrity of the research design was handed to them at this time to reinforce the oral discussion (see Appendix). This letter also set forth the benefits that each participating teacher would receive:

1. percentile rankings on the Total Reading score of all the teacher's participating students

2. a set of all four tests on the stories

3. a distribution of the scores of the teacher's students on each story by presentation mode group (twelve distributions) and a record of the scores of each student

4. a copy of each of the audiocassettes used

5. an account of the results of the study after data analysis.

The teachers also received at this time the written schedule for the participation of their classes and the written schedule for the participation of all the schools in the study (see Appendix).

The Comprehensive Tests of Basic Skills (1975) was administered to the students in four of the schools (Baker, Belaire, Scotlandville, and Woodlawn) during the two weeks immediately preceding the presentation-testing period and to the students in two of the schools (McKinley and

Glen Oaks) during the two weeks immediately following the presentation-testing period. The classroom teachers administered this test during two class periods on two consecutive days in most cases, since the two parts require eleven minutes and thirty-five minutes respectively; one class period of fifty minutes was not long enough for the proper administration of both sections. In two schools (Belaire and McKinley) classes were involved that worked in longer blocks of time; therefore, the CTBS was administered in one session in those situations. The investigator hand-scored these answer sheets.

The presentation of each story and the test following it took place in one class period, with the exception of "To Build a Fire." The print versions, recorded versions, and film versions of "The Tell-Tale Heart," "The Lottery," and "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" were all less than thirty minutes long; therefore, the presentations and the tests fitted without difficulty into the fifty-minute periods. The running time of the recorded readings was the amount of time allowed for the silent reading of the printed texts of the stories. "To Build a Fire," however, required forty-five minutes for the recorded oral reading and, consequently, for the silent reading of the printed story. A decision was made, therefore, to perform all presentations (recording, film, and print) of "To Build a Fire" on one day and administer the test on it on the next calendar day. The presentations and tests for the other three stories were accomplished in one period for each story.

A significant aspect of the design of this study was the fact that the students were informed that their scores on the short story tests would be included in the determination of their nine-weeks grades. The object of this use of the scores was to insure a reasonable level of

motivation on the part of the students and to make the study of immediate practical use to the teachers.

Beginning the week of October 25, 1976, each participating class was exposed to one story per week for four weeks. The weekly intervals between presentations were desirable for two reasons. The practice effect on the tests was minimized, and the classroom teachers involved were better able to absorb the activities of the study into their regular instructional program with less disruption than if they had had to give up six or seven straight days from their on-going plans.

In order to minimize the Hawthorne effect, the classroom teachers performed all the presentations and administered all the tests, but the investigator scored all tests. A boxed kit was put together for each of the stories, and these kits were transported to the teachers in accordance with the predetermined schedule during the four weeks of the manipulation (see Appendix).

Each kit contained:

1. the sixteen millimeter film version of the short story
2. the audiocassette of the recorded reading of the story
3. the test on the story in class-sized numbers
4. answer sheets for the test sufficient for three classes
5. two laminated sheets of detailed instructions for presenting the film, audiocassette, and print versions of the story and for administering the test (see Appendix).

Arrangements had been made previously for each teacher to have available on scheduled days a sixteen millimeter film projector, an audiocassette player, and a sufficient number of textbooks containing the printed short stories.

The schedule was designed for four of the schools to present material and administer tests on Mondays (and Tuesday for the school working with "To Build a Fire" on a particular week) and for two schools to present material and administer tests on Wednesdays (and Tuesday or Thursday when "To Build a Fire" was used). This arrangement enabled the use of all four kits simultaneously on Mondays and the simultaneous use of two of them on Wednesdays. It was possible, therefore, to handle the logistics of delivering the kits to the schools, picking them up, removing marked answer sheets and replacing them with unused ones, and delivering the kits to the schools scheduled to use them next. This schedule also took into consideration the fact that many high schools have regular classes on Thursdays and Fridays interrupted by assemblies in preparation for interscholastic athletic events during the fall semester.

RESEARCH DESIGN

This study was designed to have three treatment groups: two experimental groups (viewing and listening) and one control group (reading). The groups were made comparable by the establishment of a covariate (standardized reading score). The criterion variable was established by the post-test score (total scores on the short story achievement tests). The group means were compared by analysis of covariance, and the hypotheses were tested at the .05 level of significance.

Chapter 4

ANALYSIS OF THE DATA

Analysis of covariance was used to compare the group means of the total scores on the short stories achievement tests among the three comprehensive groups and among the three sub-groups in each socioeconomic level cluster. Before comparison, the means were adjusted by this procedure, holding all of the groups equal in reading vocabulary and reading comprehension by using the Total Reading score of the Comprehensive Tests of Basic Skills as covariate so that student reading ability was not a confounding variable.

The data analysis tested the hypotheses related to (1) the comprehensive groups, including all of the schools participating in the study, (2) the groups in high socioeconomic level schools, (3) the groups in middle range socioeconomic level schools, and (4) the groups in low socioeconomic level schools.

COMPREHENSIVE GROUPS: SCHOOLS OF ALL SOCIOECONOMIC LEVELS

The three inclusive groups were students who listened to recorded readings (N = 75), students who read printed stories (N = 66), and students who viewed films (N = 60), a total of 201 participants.

Three null hypotheses related to these groups were tested at the .05 level of significance.

H_1: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students who read selected stories and eleventh grade students who view film versions of these stories.

H_2: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students who read selected stories and eleventh grade students who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

H_3: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students who view film versions of selected stories and eleventh grade students who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

The total variance of the reading test scores and the combined short stories test scores was analyzed to determine which portion of the variance could be attributed to differences among the groups and which portion to differences among the individuals within the groups. Table 1 displays the outcomes of this procedure.

Table 1

Analysis of Covariance of Short Stories Test Scores: Comprehensive Groups

Source of Variation	df	$SS_{y.x}$	$MS_{y.x}$
Among Means	2	2409.6	1204.8
Within Groups	197	14566.5	73.9

$F = \frac{1204.8}{73.9} = 16.30$

For df 2/197
F at .05 level = 3.04
F at .01 level = 4.71

Degrees of freedom available among and within means are given under the heading "df". The column headed "$SS_{y.x}$" shows the sum of the squares of the combined short stories test (Y) scores as adjusted by the reading text (X) scores. The column headed "$MS_{y.x}$" gives the mean squares of the combined short stories test scores as adjusted by the reading test scores, and these values represent the adjusted variance of the short stories test scores.

The F ratio of 16.30 met the test of significance at the .05 level of confidence, indicating that significant differences were present among the means of the three groups of scores and requiring further steps to locate these differences.

The regression coefficient for within groups (b = .58) was computed and used in the formula

$$M_{y.x} = M_y - b\ (M_x - Gen.M_x)$$

to arrive at means for each of the presentation mode groups on the short stories tests adjusted in relation to the means on the reading test. Table 2 shows the number of subjects (N), the mean of the reading test (M_x), the mean on the short stories test (M_y), and the adjusted mean on the short stories test ($M_{y.x}$) for all three groups.

Table 2

Means of Reading (M_x) and Short Stories (M_y) Tests and Adjusted Y Means ($M_{y.x}$): Comprehensive Groups

Groups	N	M_x	M_y	$M_{y.x}$
Listeners	75	40.95	48.29	50.34
Readers	66	47.56	60.52	58.73
Viewers	60	45.50	55.48	54.99

Table 3 displays the adjusted means of the short stories tests, the differences between means of pairs of groups, and the levels of significance met in t tests.

Table 3

Analysis of Differences Among Adjusted Means: Comprehensive Groups

Group Pairs	Means	Difference Between Means	Level of Significance
Readers Listeners	58.73 50.34	8.39	.01
Readers Viewers	58.73 54.99	3.74	.05
Listeners Viewers	50.34 54.99	4.65	.01

Since the differences between the means of all pairs of presentation mode groups were larger than the differences required for significance, the three null hypotheses (H_1, H_2, and H_3) were rejected at the .05 level of confidence.

GROUPS IN HIGH SOCIOECONOMIC LEVEL SCHOOLS

The three groups from high socioeconomic level schools were twenty-three students who listened to recorded readings, twenty-three students who read printed stories, and twenty-four students who viewed films, a total of seventy subjects.

Three null hypotheses related to these groups were tested at the .05 level of significance.

H_{1a}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving high socioeconomic areas who read selected stories and students in such schools who view film versions of these stories.

H_{2a}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving high socioeconomic areas who read selected stories and students in such schools who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

H_{3a}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving high socioeconomic areas who view film versions of selected stories and students in such schools who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

The procedures used to determine the variance of the short stories test scores as adjusted to hold reading ability constant for the comprehensive groups were also used with the high socioeconomic level groups. The results are displayed in Table 4.

Table 4

Analysis of Covariance of Short Stories Test Scores: High Socioeconomic Groups

Source of Variation	df	$SS_{y.x}$	$MS_{y.x}$
Among Means	2	675.5	337.75
Within Groups	66	3119.7	47.27

$$F = \frac{337.75}{47.27} = 7.15$$

For df 2/66
F at .05 level = 3.14
F at .01 level = 4.94

The F ratio of 7.15 met the test of significance at the .05 level of confidence, indicating that significant differences were present among

the means of the three groups of scores; and further steps were needed to locate these differences.

The regression coefficient for within groups (b = .46) was computed, and the means for all three presentation mode groups on the short stories tests were adjusted in terms of the means on the reading test, using the same procedure as with the comprehensive groups. Table 5 shows the means of the reading and short stories tests and the adjusted means of the short stories test.

Table 5

Means of Reading (M_x) and Short Stories (M_y) Tests and Adjusted Y Means ($M_{y.x}$): High Socioeconomic Groups

Groups	N	M_x	M_y	$M_{y.x}$
Listeners	23	52.74	58.39	58.19
Readers	23	54.22	65.74	64.86
Viewers	24	50.04	57.21	58.25

Table 6 displays the adjusted means of the short stories tests, the differences between the means of pairs of groups, and the levels of significance met in t tests.

The differences between the means of the reading group and the listening group and between the reading group and the viewing group were greater than the differences required for significance at the .05 level of confidence. The two related null hypotheses (H_{1a} and H_{2a}) were rejected as a consequence. The difference between the adjusted means of the listening group and the viewing group was not as large as the value required for significance at the .05 level of confidence; therefore, the related null hypothesis (H_{3a}) was accepted.

Table 6

Analysis of Differences Among Adjusted Means: High Socioeconomic Groups

Group Pairs	Means	Difference Between Means	Level of Significance
Readers Listeners	64.86 58.19	6.67	.01
Readers Viewers	64.86 58.25	6.61	.01
Listeners Viewers	58.19 58.25	.06	NO

GROUPS IN MIDDLE RANGE SOCIOECONOMIC LEVEL SCHOOLS

The three groups from middle range socioeconomic level schools were twenty-four students who listened to recorded readings, twenty-five students who read printed short stories, and nineteen students who viewed films, a total of sixty-eight subjects.

Three null hypotheses related to these groups were tested at the .05 level of significance.

H_{1b}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving middle range socioeconomic areas who read selected stories and students in such schools who view film versions of these stories.

H_{2b}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving middle range socioeconomic areas who read selected stories and students in such schools who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

H_{3b}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving middle range socioeconomic areas who view film versions of selected short stories and students in such schools who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

The procedures employed with the comprehensive groups and the high socioeconomic groups were also used with the middle range groups to determine the variance and to adjust the short stories test scores so as to hold reading ability constant. Table 7 arrays the results.

Table 7

Analysis of Covariance of Short Stories Test Scores: Middle Range Socioeconomic Groups

Source of Variation	df	$SS_{y.x}$	$MS_{y.x}$
Among Means	2	139.0	69.5
Within Groups	64	4420.1	69.1

$$F = \frac{69.5}{69.1} = 1.006$$

For df 2/64
F at .05 level = 3.14
F at .01 level = 4.96

The F ratio of 1.006 did not meet the test of significance at the .05 level of confidence; therefore, the assumption was made that statistically significant differences did not exist among the means of the short stories test scores of the presentation mode groups. The three related null hypotheses (H_{1b}, H_{2b}, and H_{3b}) were accepted. See page 128 of the Appendix for the means and adjusted means of the middle range socioeconomic schools' test scores (Table 12).

GROUPS IN LOW SOCIOECONOMIC LEVEL SCHOOLS

The three groups from low socioeconomic level schools were twenty-eight students who listened to recorded readings, eighteen students who read printed stories, and seventeen students who viewed films, a total of sixty-three subjects.

Three null hypotheses related to these groups were tested at the .05 level of significance.

H_{1c}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving low socioeconomic areas who read selected stories and students in such schools who view film versions of these stories.

H_{2c}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving low socioeconomic areas who read selected stories and students in such schools who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

H_{3c}: There is no significant difference between the short stories test scores of eleventh grade students in schools serving low socioeconomic areas who view film versions of selected short stories and students in such schools who listen to recorded readings of these stories.

The same procedures that were applied to the comprehensive, high socioeconomic, and middle range socioeconomic groups were used with the low socioeconomic groups to determine the variance of the short stories test scores, adjusted to hold reading ability constant. Table 8 shows the results of this first stage of the data analysis.

Table 8

Analysis of Covariance of Short Stories Test Scores: Low Socioeconomic Groups

Source of Variation	df	$SS_{y.x}$	$Ms_{y.x}$
Among Means	2	2740.1	1370.1
Within Groups	59	3490.3	59.2

$$F = \frac{1370.1}{59.2} = 23.14$$

For df 2/59
F at .05 level = 3.15
F at .01 level = 4.98

The F ratio of 23.14 met the test of significance at the .05 level of confidence, indicating that significant differences were present among the means of the three groups of scores; and further steps were needed to locate these differences.

The regression coefficient for <u>within</u> groups (b = .59) was calculated, and the means for all three presentation mode groups on the short stories tests were adjusted in terms of the means on the reading test. Table 9 displays the means of the reading and short stories tests and the adjusted means of the short stories tests.

Table 9

Means of Reading (M_x) and Short Stories (M_y) Tests and Adjusted Y Means ($M_{y.x}$): Low Socioeconomic Groups

Groups	N	M_x	M_y	$M_{y.x}$
Listeners	28	29.93	33.89	36.76
Readers	18	41.72	55.11	51.02
Viewers	17	35.47	50.76	50.36

Table 10 shows the adjusted means of the short stories tests, the differences between means of pairs of groups, and the levels of significance met in t tests.

Table 10

Analysis of Differences Among Adjusted Means: Low Socioeconomic Groups

Group Pairs	Means	Difference Between Means	Level of Significance
Readers Listeners	51.02 36.76	14.26	.01
Readers Viewers	51.02 50.36	.66	NO
Listeners Viewers	36.76 50.36	13.60	.01

The differences between the adjusted means of the reading group and the listening group and between the viewing group and the listening group were greater than the differences required for significance. The two related null hypotheses (H_{2c} and H_{3c}) were, therefore, rejected at the .05 level of confidence. The difference between the adjusted means of the reading group and the viewing group was not as large as the value required for significance; consequently, the related null hypothesis (H_{1c}) was accepted.

In summary, all three null hypotheses of no differences among the comprehensive presentation mode groups were rejected. In the high socioeconomic level schools, the null hypotheses of no differences between the reading group and the listening group and between the reading group and the viewing group were rejected; but the null

hypothesis of no difference between the viewing group and the listening group was accepted. In the middle range socioeconomic level schools, all three null hypotheses of no differences among the presentation mode groups were accepted. In the low socioeconomic level schools, the null hypotheses of no difference between the reading group and the listening group and between the viewing group and the listening group were rejected; but the null hypothesis of no difference between the reading group and the viewing group was accepted.

Table 11, page 62, is a summary tabular representation of these outcomes.

Table 11

Summary of Differences Among Means

Comparison Groups	N	$M_{y.x}$	Difference Between Means	Level of Significance
Comprehensive	201			
Readers	66	58.73	3.74	.05
Viewers	60	54.99		
Readers	66	58.73	8.39	.01
Listeners	75	50.34		
Viewers	60	54.99	4.65	.01
Listeners	75	50.34		
High Socioeconomic	70			
Readers	23	64.86	6.61	.01
Viewers	24	58.25		
Readers	23	64.86	6.67	.01
Listeners	23	58.19		
Viewers	24	58.25	.06	NO
Listeners	23	58.19		
Middle Socioeconomic	68			
Readers	25	59.48	3.24	NO
Viewers	19	56.24		
Readers	25	59.48	2.67	NO
Listeners	24	56.81		
Viewers	19	56.24	.57	NO
Listeners	24	56.81		
Low Socioeconomic	63			
Readers	18	51.02	.66	NO
Viewers	17	50.36		
Readers	18	51.02	14.26	.01
Listeners	28	36.76		
Viewers	17	50.36	13.60	.01
Listeners	28	36.76		

Chapter 5

CONCLUSIONS

A number of conclusions have been drawn from the evidence of this study by summarizing its results, by indicating the factors that limit the extent to which it can be generalized, and by suggesting some of its implications for teaching and further research. Observations have also been made regarding approaches that make classroom research more acceptable to school personnel involved.

SUMMARY OF RESULTS

Of the twelve null hypotheses that were tested by this study, five were accepted, indicating no statistically significant differences between the pair of groups compared in each case. All three null hypotheses related to the middle range socioeconomic schools were accepted, since the scores of the reading, viewing, and listening groups were not different enough from each other to designate them as separate populations or to suggest any of the methods of presentation as more useful than any other on this level. The viewers and listeners from high socioeconomic level schools also displayed so little difference that the hypothesis of no difference was accepted, and the readers and viewers from low socioeconomic level schools were so similar in their scores that neither presentation mode could be said to be more effective in relation to test results than the other for them.

Seven null hypotheses were rejected because of differences significant at the .05 level of confidence. In the comprehensive groups, including all six schools, the readers' mean of 58.73 was significantly different from the viewers' mean of 54.99, suggesting student silent reading of short stories as superior to student viewing of film versions of short stories; and the viewers' mean of 54.99 was significantly different from the listeners' mean of 50.34, indicating that reading and viewing films were better methods than listening to recorded readings of short stories.

In the high socioeconomic schools, the readers' mean of 64.86 was significantly different from the viewers' mean of 58.25 and the listeners' mean of 58.19, allowing the interpretation that reading short stories is superior as a method to both viewing film versions and listening to recorded readings for these groups.

In the low socioeconomic schools, the readers' mean of 51.02 and the viewers' mean of 50.36 were significantly different from the listeners' mean of 36.76, suggesting reading and viewing films to be better methods for these schools than listening to recorded readings.

FACTORS AFFECTING GENERALIZATIONS

Certain influences have limited the extent to which the results of this study can be generalized to all eleventh grade English students: (1) absenteeism, (2) limited numbers, (3) use of existing classes in schools of designated socioeconomic levels, and (4) participation by large high schools in only one urban school system.

Of the 392 eleventh grade students in the eighteen classes participating in this study, 191 were disqualified as usable subjects

because of one or more absences on the days of presentation and testing. How this uncontrolled attrition of the sample affected the outcomes of the study can only be speculated upon. Were all of the presentation mode groups changed equally? Were as many students of high ability absent as students of low ability? Only another separate study of absenteeism could give helpful answers to these questions. The use of analysis of covariance to hold all the groups equal in reading ability must be depended upon under such circumstances to preserve the integrity of the study.

Aside from a possibly qualitative change in the sample as a result of excessive absenteeism, the numbers of the sample were reduced severely, both by irregular attendance and by the fact that many of the participating classes contained relatively high percentages of twelfth grade students, who could not be included in the comparison groups. This reduction in numbers has not only reduced confidence in generalizations, but may also have reduced the chance for statistically significant differences, especially in the middle range socioeconomic level schools.

The use of existing classes in schools designated as representative of certain socioeconomic levels rather than forming groups by selecting students designated individually as belonging to these levels has diluted, to some degree, the dependence that can be placed on generalizations involving specific sub-groups. General statements can be based more confidently on the comprehensive groups comparisons than on the sub-groups.

The sample was taken from large high schools in one urban system, a fact that does not facilitate the application of the results to small rural high schools or to school systems in other parts of the state or nation.

IMPLICATIONS FOR TEACHING

The conclusions of this study that are pertinent to methods of teaching center on (1) the general superiority of student reading as a method, (2) the weakness of students in listening, (3) the relative effectiveness of film versions of short stories, in comparison to recordings, (4) the special effectiveness of student reading in high socioeconomic schools, (5) the usefulness of film and recordings as supplements in middle range socioeconomic schools, and (6) the relative lack of value of recordings to low socioeconomic schools.

No other presentation mode is an adequate substitute for student reading of original printed versions of short stories. Students achieve more cognitive learning by such reading than they do by viewing film versions or listening to recordings and, at the same time, exercise and develop the skills and abilities in reading that have broad application in their other educational activities and in their lives outside of school.

Students do not listen well when an auditory presentation of short stories is used with no related visual stimuli, at least in an ordinary classroom situation with the distractions that are normal in such an environment. The presence of a reader, rather than a recording, would furnish the visual connection required (Maberry, 1975), but an electronic audio source alone strains the ability of students to concentrate on the stories.

Films of short stories are more effective than recorded readings of them but not as useful, overall, as student silent reading of printed stories. As excellent film versions of short stories become more economical and more accessible to classroom teachers, perhaps through the

technology of the videodisc (Wood and Stephens, 1977), there may be a trend toward substituting the film version for the silent reading of the story as a convenient way of coping with problems in student interest and/or reading ability. This strategy would seem misguided in the light of the results of the present study. Such films have their place as supplements to student reading: to heighten interest in the story, to make the story more easily read, to furnish a parallel version for analytical comparison, or to act as a critical commentary on the original. Such films can even be used apart from reading as the objects of serious consideration in a film study course, but teachers must not make the mistake of assuming that any film can ever take the place of any printed short story in appropriately directed learning experiences.

The fact that the high socioeconomic school groups showed a significant advantage for the readers over the viewers and listeners, who were not significantly different from each other, indicates that less supplementation of student reading with mediated versions is necessary to achieve cognitive goals in these schools. Also among these groups, the attention-getting visual devices of film are at least equally compensated for by the fact that recorded readings contain the entire text of the short stories, upon which the tests were based, and by the fact that these students are relatively good listeners.

The lack of any statistically significant differences among the middle range socioeconomic school groups can be attributed in part to the classical difficulty of finding differences in the middle areas of subjects in any experimental educational research. The relationships among the groups on this level suggest that recorded readings and film versions of short stories are both useful supplements to student reading of the printed stories.

Since the reading and viewing groups in the low socioeconomic schools achieved significantly more than the listening groups, the use of recorded readings of short stories would seem to be contra-indicated in such schools. Film versions, however, appear to be valid supplementary materials in teaching short stories to these students.

IMPLICATIONS FOR RESEARCH

Suggestions for further research include replications with changes in the sample and the audio sources, the use of a similar approach to poetry presentations, study designs adjusted to cope with absenteeism, and studies that emphasize affective achievement.

The present study should be replicated using subjects from other sections of the nation, from small high schools, from rural high schools, and from other grade levels. Another worthwhile alteration in design for replication purposes would be to use commercially recorded readings by professional actors or non-recorded solo presentations by specially qualified readers instead of teacher-recorded readings of the stories.

The same general experimental design could be utilized with poetry as the central consideration rather than the short story. A number of superior film presentations of poems are available for such purposes.

Future experimental studies would be better designed if the presence of the subjects at school on a relatively large number of days were not required. Any reduction in the number of days should increase the size of the sample.

Future studies might also attempt to come to grips with the problem of affective learning that results in such cross-media comparisons.

Levinson (1963) and Maberry (1975) approached this subject peripherally. English teachers are concerned with affective outcomes just as they are with cognitive ones (Sheridan and others, 1965). While the present study makes available some needed information about the relative usefulness of films, recordings, and printed stories in achieving cognitive objectives, many of the assumptions about the value of films and recordings in the affective domain remain unchallenged.

OBSERVATIONS

As the practical difficulties of conducting this experimental study were encountered and resolved, two aspects of educational research in the public schools stood out as important enough to receive special mention: the necessity for the investigator to engage in friendly persuasiveness with all school personnel and the importance of planning and executing the experiment with no sense of disrupting normal instructional procedures.

For over a month, as school officials and teachers were encountered on a regular basis and each of the six schools was visited at least twice weekly, the investigator consciously attempted to project a strong positive image of confidence, personal concern, dependability, professional integrity, and leadership. The qualities required of the educational researcher in this phase of the endeavor were more like those of the successful sales representative than those of the scholarly researcher. The classroom teachers always responded in kind to warm words of cheerful support and to expressions of appreciation for their helpful participation in a worthwhile project.

No aggregation of positive personal qualities would have sufficed, however, if the whole study had not been planned to cause as little interruption as possible in the classroom teachers' overall instructional programs. Stories and films were chosen which these teachers would have used anyway in the course of the year or semester. The presentations and testing were spaced at intervals that allowed the continuation of other unit plans. Test scores were furnished to teachers for use as components in nine-weeks grade averages. The teachers received extra benefits in the form of reading comprehension percentile scores for all their students involved, copies of the achievement tests for future use, and copies of the audiotapes used in the study. As soon as the data analysis was completed, all school personnel involved received a brief written summary of the results.

Experimental research can be conducted in public school classrooms in a manner that will cause subsequent researchers to be welcomed as contributing members of the educational team. An important goal of this study was for the participants to feel that their time had been well spent and that educational research can be so integrated with ongoing instruction that it contributes to accomplishing teachers' objectives rather than obstructing their realization.

REFERENCES CITED

BOOKS

Bluestone, George. Novels into Film. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1961.

Bruner, Jerome S. The Process of Education. New York: Vintage Books, 1963.

Buros, Oscar K. The Seventh Mental Measurements Yearbook. Highland Park, N. J.: The Gryphon Press, 1972.

Carver, Merton E. "Listening Versus Reading," The Psychology of Radio, ed. Hadley Cantril and Gordon W. Allport. New York: Harper, 1935, pp. 159-80.

Chu, Godwin C., and Wilbur Schramm. Learning from Television: What Research Says. Revised Edition. Washington, D. C.: National Association of Educational Broadcasters, 1975.

Duker, Sam. Listening Bibliography. Metuchen, N. J.: The Scarecrow Press, 1971.

_____, ed. Listening: Readings, Volume 2. Metuchen, N. J.: The Scarecrow Press, 1971.

Fuller, Edmund, and B. Jo Kinnick. Adventures in American Literature. Laureate Edition. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, Inc., 1963.

Fulton, A. R. Motion Pictures: The Development of an Art from Silent Films to the Age of Television. Norman, Oklahoma: University of Oklahoma Press, 1960.

Garrett, Henry E. Statistics in Psychology and Education. New York: David McKay Company, Inc., 1966.

Gehlmann, John, and Mary Rives Bowman. Adventures in American Literature. Olympic Edition. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, Inc., 1958.

Hovland, C. I., A. A. Lumsdaine, and F. D. Sheffield. Experiments in Mass Communication. Princeton, N. J.: Princeton University Press, 1949.

McKeachie, Wilbert J. "Higher Education," The New Media and Education, ed. Peter H. Rossi and Bruce J. Biddle. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company, 1966, pp. 260-300.

Magny, Claude-Edmonde. The Age of the American Novel: The Film Aesthetic of Fiction Between the Two Wars. New York: Ungar, 1972.

Maline, Julian L., and James Berkley. Modern Fiction. New York: Random House, Inc., 1967.

May, M. A., and A. A. Lumsdaine. Learning from Films. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1958.

Richardson, Robert. Literature and Film. Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, 1969.

Sheridan, Marion C., and others. The Motion Picture and the Teaching of English. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1965.

Worth, Sol. "The Uses of Film in Education and Communication," Media and Symbols: The Forms of Expression, Communication, and Education, ed. David Olson. The Seventh-third Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education, Part I. Chicago: National Society for the Study of Education, 1974.

PERIODICALS

Allen, William H. "Instructional Media Research: Past, Present, and Future," AV Communication Review, XIX, 1 (Spring, 1971), 5-18.

_____. "Intellectual Abilities and Instructional Media Design," AV Communication Review, XXXIII (Summer, 1975), 139-170.

_____. "What Do 50 Years of Media Research Tell Us?" Audiovisual Instruction

Arrowsmith, William. "Film as Educator," Journal of Aesthetic Education, III, 3 (July, 1969), 75-83.

Breiter, Joan C. "Reading or Listening: A Comparison of Techniques of Instruction in Elementary Social Studies," The Alberta Journal of Educational Research, XXI, 2 (June, 1975), 130-140.

Campeau, Peggie L. "Selective Review of the Results of Research on the Use of Audiovisual Media to Teach Adults," AV Communication Review, XXII (Spring, 1974), 5-40.

Carver, Ronald P. "Use of a Recently Developed Listening Comprehension Test to Investigate the Effect of Disadvantagement upon Verbal Proficiency," American Educational Research Journal, VI, 2 (March, 1969), 263-270.

Childers, Perry R. "Black Pupils Can Be Taught to Listen," Journal of Experimental Education, XXXIX, 4 (Summer, 1971), 24-25.

Coppen, Helen. "Film Research in Great Britain -- Two Studies," Educational Media International, II (1972), 7-12.

Corey, Stephen M. "Learning from Lectures Versus Learning from Readings," Journal of Educational Psychology, XXV (September, 1934), 459-70.

Denby, Robert V. "NCTE/ERIC Report on Research in Listening and Listening Skills," Elementary English, XLVI, 4 (April, 1969), 511-17.

_____. "NCTE/ERIC Summaries & Sources: Film Study in the Secondary School," English Journal, LVIII, 8 (November, 1969), 1259-67.

Devine, Thomas G. "Listening," Review of Educational Research, XXXVII (April, 1967), 152-158.

Duckworth, Joseph B., and Peter K. Hoover-Suczek. "Reel to Real: Teaching Adolescent Psychology through Film," Phi Delta Kappan, LVII (May, 1976), 595-597 and 601.

Durrell, Donald D. "Listening Comprehension Versus Reading Comprehension," Journal of Reading, XII, 6 (March, 1969), 455-60.

Eisner, Elliot W. "Media, Expression and the Arts," Studies in Art Education, XIII, 1 (Fall, 1971), 4-12.

Elin, Rhoderick J. "Listening: Neglected and Forgotten in the Classroom," Elementary English, XLIX (February, 1972), 230-32.

Felheim, Marvin. "Criticism and the Films of Shakespeare's Plays," Comparative Drama, IX (Summer, 1975), 147-155.

Forsdale, Joan Rosengren, and Louis Forsdale. "Film Literacy," AV Communication Review, XVIII, 3 (Fall, 1970), 263-76.

Gratz, Elizabeth W. "Goal: Maxi-Listening," English Journal, LXII (February, 1973), 268-71.

Hoban, Charles F. "The State of the Art of Films in Instruction: A Second Look," Audiovisual Instruction, XX (April, 1975), 30-34.

Hodgkinson, Anthony W. "North Reading and the Screen Media," Educational Leadership, XXVII, 5 (February, 1970), 481-84.

Hogan, Robert F., and Stephen Judy. "The 'Back to Basics' Controversy," Media & Methods, XIII, 1 (September, 1976), 17-18 and 54-56.

Hollingsworth, Paul M. "Interrelating Listening and Reading," International Reading Association Conference, Proceedings, Part 1, XIII (April, 1968), 63-67.

Isaacson, David. "Film Study in the High School English Curriculum," English Journal, LXII (April, 1973), 651-58.

Jamison, Dean, Patrick Suppes, and Stuart Wells. "The Effectiveness of Alternate Instructional Media: A Survey," Review of Educational Research, XLIV (Winter, 1974), 1-67.

Kalkofen, Hermann. "Instructional Film Research: Some Notes on Methodology," Educational Media International, II (1972), 2-6.

Katz, John Stuart. "An Integrated Approach to the Teaching of Film and Literature," The English Quarterly, II (January, 1969), 25-29.

Keller, Paul W. "Major Findings in Listening in the Past Ten Years," Journal of Communication, X, 1 (March, 1960), 29-38.

Kirkton, Carole Masley. "NCTE/ERIC Summaries & Sources -- Media Literacy: Focus on Film," English Journal, LX (September, 1971), 831-38.

Kopstein, F. F., and S. M. Roshal. "Learning Foreign Vocabulary from Pictures vs. Words," American Psychologist, IX (1954), 407-8.

Kramer, Edward J., and Thomas R. Lewis. "Comparison of Visual and Non-Visual Listening," Journal of Communication, I, 2 (November, 1951), 16-20.

LaRocque, Geraldine E. "It Is a Great Art to Saunter," English Journal, LXV (September, 1976), 30-33.

Many, W. A. "Is There Really Any Difference -- Reading vs. Listening," The Reading Teacher, XIX (1965), 110-113.

May, Mark A., and Nelle Lee Jenkinson. "Developing Interest in Reading With Film," AV Communication Review, I (Summer, 1953), 159-166.

Miller, N. M. "Scientific Principles for Maximum Learning from Motion Pictures," Audio-Visual Communication Review, V (1957), 61-113.

Miller, William C. "Film Movement and Affective Response and the Effect on Learning and Attitude Formation," AV Communication Review, XVII, 2 (Summer, 1969), 172-81.

Morrow, James, and Murray Suid. "Media in the English Classroom: Some Pedagogical Issues," English Journal, LXIII (October, 1974), 37-44.

Parker, Herbert S. "Is Film a Significant Instructional Resource?" Audiovisual Instruction, XV, 1 (January, 1970), 47-48.

Powell, David J. "Film and the Media (R)Evolution," Audiovisual Instruction, XVI, 1 (January, 1971), 29-31.

Russell, David H. "A Conspectus of Recent Research on Listening Abilities," Elementary English, XLI, 3 (March, 1964), 262-67.

Schwartz, Sheila. "Introducing Literature through Film," Elementary English, XLVIII, 3 (March, 1971), 304-15.

Silva, Fred. "To Look or To See: Film Study in the English Curriculum," The English Record, XX (October, 1969), 38-45.

Swalm, James E. "A Comparison of Oral Reading, Silent Reading and Listening Comprehension," Education, XCII (April-May, 1972), 111-15.

Vineyard, Edwin E., and Robert B. Bailey. "Interrelationships of Reading Ability, Listening Skill, Intelligence, and Scholastic Achievement," Journal of Developmental Reading, III (Spring, 1960), 174-178.

Wetstone, Harriet S., and Bernard Z. Friedlander. "The Effect of Live, TV, and Audio Story Narration on Primary Grade Children's Listening Comprehension," Journal of Educational Research, LXVIII (September, 1974), 32-35.

Witty, Paul A., and James Fitzwater. "An Experiment with Films, Film Readers, and the Magnetic Sound Track Projector," Elementary English, XXX (April, 1953), 232-241.

Wood, R. Kent, and Kent G. Stephens. "An Educator's Guide to Videodisc Technology," Phi Delta Kappan, LVIII, 6 (February, 1977), 466-467.

Young, Robert Q. "A Comparison of Reading and Listening Comprehension with Rate of Presentation Controlled," AV Communication Review, XXI (Fall, 1973), 327-336.

THESES, DISSERTATIONS, AND DISSERTATION ABSTRACTS

Anderson, Albert A., Jr. "Film Study as Aesthetic Education: A Foundation for Curriculum," Dissertation Abstracts International, 35 (May, 1975), 7023A (The Ohio State University).

Brady, Mary Ann. "An Investigation of Relative Effectiveness of Film, Slide-audiotape, and Print Stimulus Media for Concept Acquisition," Dissertation Abstracts International, 36 (December, 1976), 3354A (Michigan State University).

Buzzard, David B. "Humanizing the Secondary English Curriculum through the Use of Film," Dissertation Abstracts International, 34 (November, 1973), 2155A (The Ohio State University).

Campbell, Paul N. "An Experimental Study of the Retention and Comprehension of Poetry Resulting from Silent Reading and Oral Interpretation," Dissertation Abstracts International, 20 (1960), 3426 (University of Southern California).

Emslie, Elizabeth, Margaret E. Kelleher, and Judy D. Leonard. "A Comparison of Achievement in Silent Reading and Listening in Grade Four." Unpublished master's thesis, Boston University, 1954.

England, Don W. "A Comparison of Certain Skills in Reading and Listening in Two Fifth-Grade Groups." Unpublished master's thesis, Ohio State University, 1953).

Gray, Wallace A. "Listeners' and Readers' Responses to Poetry," Dissertation Abstracts International, 19 (1958), 190-191 (Columbia University).

Hampleman, Richard S. "Comparison of Listening and Reading Comprehension Ability of Fourth and Sixth Grade Pupils," Dissertation Abstracts International, 15 (1955), 1757-1758 (Indiana University).

Hannah, Jo Morrison. "A Study of Listening from the Ruesch-Bateson Theory of Communication," Dissertation Abstracts International, 22 (1962), 3775 (University of Denver).

Hoachlander, Marjorie E. "Book-in-Motion/Book-in-Print," Dissertation Abstracts International, 36 (April, 1976), 6430A-6431A (University of Maryland).

Holladay, John M. "Trends in the Use of Film Among English Teachers at Selected Colleges and Universities in Michigan," Dissertation Abstracts International, 33 (May, 1973), 6235A-6236A (University of Michigan.

Hyman, Henry A. "Filmmaking Activities in Secondary Schools of the Greater New York Metropolitan Area 1970-71," Dissertation Abstracts International, 34 (April, 1974), 6517A (Columbia University).

Jones, William M. "An Exploratory Study of the Effects of Two Media Presentations on Performance in Reasoning," Dissertation Abstracts International, 24 (1963), 434-435 (University of Washington).

Levinson, Elias. "Effects of Motion Pictures on the Response to Narrative: A Study of the Effects of Film Versions of Certain Short Stories on the Responses of Junior High School Students." Unpublished PhD dissertation, New York University, 1963.

Lewis, William J. "A Comparison of Responses of Adolescents to Narrative and Lyric Literature and Film." Unpublished PhD dissertation, Florida State University, 1972.

Maberry, David R. "A Comparison of Three Techniques of Teaching Literature: Silent Reading, Solo Performance, and Readers Theatre." Unpublished PhD dissertation, North Texas State University, 1975.

Niemi, Richard E. "Response-Centered Teaching and Secondary Film Education," Dissertation Abstracts International, 36 (May, 1976), 7327A (Northwestern University).

Phair, Anthony J. "Comparison of Cognitive Learning from a 16mm Motion Picture, a 35 mm Sound Filmstrip, Soundtrack Only, and Printed Narration, Using Immediate and Delayed Retention Scores in Sixth Grade Social Studies," Dissertation Abstracts International, 36 (February, 1976), 4968A (Catholic University of America).

Smith, Jack E. "Reading, Listening, and Reading-Listening Comprehension by Sixth-Grade Children," Dissertation Abstracts International, 20 (1959), 959-960 (Columbia University).

MISCELLANEOUS SOURCES

Comprehensive Tests of Basic Skills. Monterey, Calif.: CTB/McGraw-Hill, 1975.

Day, Willard F., and Barbard R. Beach. "A Survey of the Research Literature Comparing the Visual and Auditory Presentation of Information," Air Force Technical Report No. 5921, November, 1950, pp. 7-9.

Dech, Robert H. Story-Related Films in Eighth Grade Developmental Reading. U.S., Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 096 608, February, 1975.

Hoban, Charles F. The State of the Art of Instructional Films. U.S., Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 055 432, September, 1971.

_____ and Edward B. van Ormer. Instructional Film Research 1918-1950. SDC Human Engineering Project 20-E-4. Sponsored jointly by Department of the Army and Department of the Navy. Special Devices Center, Port Washington, L.I., N.Y., March, 1950.

Johnson, Ted. Using Film in the Classroom. U.S., Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 085 759, May, 1974.

Kishler, J. P. The Effects of Prestige and Identification Factors on Attitude Restructuring and Learning from Sound Films. Instructional Film Research Report SDC 269-7-10. Special Devices Center, Office of Naval Research, March, 1950.

McTavish, C. L. Effect of Repetitive Film Showings on Learning. Instructional Film Research Report SDC 269-7-12, Special Devices Center, Office of Naval Research, November, 1949.

Mertens, M. S. The Effects of Mental Hygiene Films on Self Regarding Attitudes. Instructional Film Research Report, SDC 269-7-22, Special Devices Center, Office of Naval Research, July, 1951.

Northrop, D. S. Effects on Learning of the Prominence of Organizational Outlines in Instructional Films. Human Engineering Report SDC 269-7-33. Research by the Instructional Film Research Program. Pennsylvania State University for the U.S. Naval Training Device Center, Port Washington, L.I., New York, October, 1952.

Quay, Lorene C., and others. Communication Encoding and Decoding in Children from Different Socioeconomic and Racial Groups. U.S., Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 124 915, November, 1976.

Reid, J. Christopher, and Donald W. MacLennan. Research in Instructional Television and Film. Washington: Bureau of Research, Office of Education, HEW, 1967.

Schubach, Deane F. Listening Bibliography. U.S., Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document 119 188, July, 1976.

Sohn, David A. Film Study and the English Teacher. U.S., Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 021 846, January, 1969.

VanderMeer, A. W. Effect of Film-viewing Practice on Learning From Instructional Films. Instructional Film Research Report SDC 269-7-20. Special Devices Center, Office of Naval Research, November, 1951.

_____. Relative Effectiveness of Instruction by Films Exclusively, Films Plus Study Guides, and Standard Lecture Methods. Instructional Film Research Report SDC 269-7-13. Special Devices Center, Office of Naval Research, July, 1950.

FILMS

Dr. Heidegger's Experiment: 16mm film, 22 min., sound, color, Encyclopaedia Britannica Educational Corporation, Chicago, 1973.

The Lottery: 16mm film, 18 min., sound, color, Encyclopaedia Britannica Educational Corporation, Chicago, 1972.

The Tell-Tale Heart: 16mm film, 8 min., sound, color, Learning Corporation of America, New York, 1973.

To Build a Fire: 16mm film, 14½ min., sound, color, BFA Educational Media, Santa Monica, Calif., 1976.

APPENDIX

2210 Pickett Avenue
Baton Rouge, Louisiana
70808

July 22, 1976

Dr. Helen Brown
Director of Research & Curriculum Development
East Baton Rouge Parish School Board Office
Post Office Box 2950
Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70821

Dear Dr. Brown:

In reference to our recent telephone conversation, I have here attached a copy of my proposal for an experimental doctoral study that I would like to carry out in our school system.

You will notice that the basic problem of the study has been altered since our discussion. The change has been made tentatively upon the advice of several members of the L.S.U. faculty, but the logistical needs and problems are still essentially the same.

The only part of this plan where time is of the essence involves the possibility of carrying out a very limited pilot study in the East Baton Rouge Summer School in order to establish the reliability of the investigator-constructed achievement tests. I believe that this can be accomplished with a minimum of interference with the summer school instructional program. We could use a different class for each story and test and base it on listening only.

I hope that you will find time to examine the proposal at your earliest convenience. You know how much I appreciate your personal and professional interest in this endeavor.

Very truly yours,

Richard L. Powers

Enclosure

ROBERT E. LEE HIGH SCHOOL
1105 LEE DRIVE
BATON ROUGE, LA. 70808

ROBERT J. MEADOR
Principal

WILLIAM H. CARRIER
Asst. Principal

FREDERICK C. CHURCH
Asst. Principal

CHARLES W. LOVE
Asst. Principal

September 29, 1976

Dr. Lorin V. Smiley
Assistant Superintendent, Instruction
East Baton Rouge Parish School Board
Post Office Box 2950
Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70821

Dear Dr. Smiley:

This summer I received permission from you to try out the reliability of four tests with students in the East Baton Rouge Summer School at Istrouma High School. The results were very satisfactory, and I would like to express my appreciation to you for your cooperation. The proposed dissertation study, of which these tests are an integral part, has recently been approved by my committee at L.S.U., and I would now like to request permission from you to carry out the larger experimental study itself in our parish school system.

Although I am attaching for your examination a copy of my proposal in its entirety, perhaps it would be helpful if I were briefly to sum up the salient points. The problem of the study is to determine whether eleventh grade English students who read certain short stories, listen to recorded readings of them, or view film versions of them score differently on tests based on the printed short stories. Three eleventh grade classes of one English teacher at each of six high schools would participate, a total of eighteen classes. Two high schools would be chosen from those designated as upper socioeconomic, two from those designated as middle-range socioeconomic, and two from those designated as low socioeconomic.

The time needed for the study from each student's school hours would be part or all of six fifty-minute periods:

1. one period for the administration of the reading section of the Comprehensive Test of Basic Skills, the score to be used as the covariant in analysis of covariance

2. one period each for the presentation of three short stories and the tests on these stories, a total of three periods

3. one period for the presentation of and one period for the test on a fourth story, the length of which prohibits its completion in one period alone, a total of two periods.

The presentations would be spread over a time span of four weeks to minimize any possibly disruptive influence on the planned instructional programs of the classroom teachers. It is hoped that the manipulation and data gathering could be completed during the present semester.

The results of this study would, of course, be furnished to you and to the school principals and teachers involved. This information should be valuable in making decisions regarding instructional strategies and in the acquisition of educational media materials.

May I please have a personal interview with you or someone designated by you to discuss further the implementation of these plans?

Very truly yours,

Richard L. Powers

Enclosure

East Baton Rouge Parish School Board
P. O. BOX 2950
Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70821

PH. (504) 926-2790

October 4, 1976

Mr. Richard Powers
2210 Pickett Avenue
Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70808

Dear Mr. Powers:

This is to advise that your request to conduct a study of methods of teaching short stories in selected high schools of the parish has been approved. It is my understanding that you would do testing in these schools during the latter weeks of October and early November. Please contact the principal of each school to make the proper arrangements for this testing.

Sincerely yours,

Lorin V. Smiley
Assistant Superintendent

LVS:SRC

cc: Mr. W. B. Breda
Mr. Robert D. West, Jr.
Mr. Jerry Epperson
Mr. William P. Honeycutt
Mr. Thomas Hollimon
Mr. W. D. Quinn

2210 Pickett Avenue
Baton Rouge, Louisiana
70808

April 11, 1977

Dr. Lorin V. Smiley
Assistant Superintendent
East Baton Rouge Parish School Board

Dear Dr. Smiley:

The experimental study of three methods of presenting short stories which was conducted in East Baton Rouge schools last fall has now been completed to the point that the data gathered have been analyzed and certain conclusions have been reached.

Among the reading, viewing, and listening groups from all six participating high schools (N = 201), those students who read the printed stories scored significantly higher on the short stories tests than those who viewed the films; and those students who viewed the films scored significantly higher than those who listened to recorded readings.

Among the groups from high socioeconomic schools (Belaire and Woodlawn), the readers scored significantly higher than the viewers and the listeners; but there was no significant difference between the scores of the viewers and the listeners.

There were no significant differences among the three presentation mode groups from the middle range socioeconomic schools (Baker and Glen Oaks).

The readers and viewers from the low socioeconomic schools (McKinley and Scotlandville) scored significantly higher than the listeners, but there was no significant difference between the scores of the readers and viewers.

The number one conclusion drawn from these results is that viewing film versions or listening to recorded readings of short stories should not be substituted for student reading of the stories.

A second conclusion is that film versions of short stories are useful supplements in the study of this literary genre.

A third conclusion is that recorded readings with no related visual stimuli should not be generally recommended for classroom presentations of short stories.

In terms of the three socioeconomic level schools, the high socioeconomic schools probably require less supplementation of reading by mediated materials for cognitive purposes than do the other schools; the middle range schools can benefit from both kinds of supplementary materials studied; and the low socioeconomic schools can profitably use

films along with printed stories but do not indicate that recorded readings are very helpful.

I would like to express my appreciation for the help and cooperation of all of the teachers, principals, and supervisors who participated in this study or otherwise made it possible.

Very truly yours,

Richard L. Powers

cc: Dr. Donald Hoover
Dr. Helen Brown
Mr. Graydon Walker
Mr. William Noonan
Mr. Ernest T. Murphree
Mrs. Odette Lang
Mrs. Lois Crews
Mrs. Jane Dickenson
Mrs. Sarah Wright
Mrs. Vickie Spiers
Mrs. Diane Stewart
Mrs. Barbara Freiberg
Mrs. Elizabeth Arnold
Mr. W. B. Breda
Mr. Robert D. West, Jr.
Mr. Jerry Epperson
Mr. William P. Honeycutt
Mr. Thomas Hollimon
Mr. W. D. Quinn
Mrs. Pat Stephens
Mrs. Elizabeth Davis
Dr. Perry Guedry

(Brief explanation of study handed to principals and teachers at first meeting with them.)

THE STUDY

The problem of the study is to determine whether eleventh grade English students who read certain short stories, listen to recorded readings of them, or view film versions of them score differently on tests based on the printed short stories. Three eleventh grade classes of one English teacher at each of six high schools will participate, a total of eighteen classes. The high schools that have been chosen to take part are McKinley High School, Belaire High School, Glen Oaks High School, Scotlandville High School, Woodlawn High School, and Baker High School. The short stories to be used are Poe's "The Tell-Tale Heart," Hawthorne's "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment," London's "To Build a Fire," and Jackson's "The Lottery."

The time needed for the study from each student's school hours will be part or all of six fifty-minute periods:

1. one period for the administration of the reading section of the Comprehensive Test of Basic Skills, the score to be used as the covariate in analysis of covariance

2. one period each for the presentation of three short stories and the tests on these stories, a total of three periods

3. one period for the presentation of and one period for the test on a fourth story, the length of which prohibits its completion in one period alone, a total of two periods.

The presentations would be spread over a time span of four weeks to minimize any possibly disruptive influence on the planned instructional programs of the classroom teachers.

The results of this study will be furnished to the Assistant Superintendent, Instruction; the school principals; and the teachers.

(Letter handed to participating teachers upon delivery of first kit of presentation materials and tests to them.)

Dear Colleague:

Let me thank you once again for your participation in this study. Its success or failure depends upon a few professionally-minded teachers, of whom you are one.

I have listed below some points that are vital to the maintenance of integrity in the research design.

1. It is essential that the presentations and testing be done on the days assigned since some materials such as tests, tapes, and films are scheduled to be used by all of the teachers involved on specific dates and must be passed on by me for re-use.

2. With the exception of "To Build a Fire," tests on all short story presentations (film, tape, and print) must follow presentation in the same period. In the case of "To Build a Fire," the tests will follow on the next calendar day for all three modes of presentation. Although the film version of "To Build a Fire" is short enough to permit the use of the test in the same period, it is essential that the test be given on the next calendar day as it must be for the other two types of presentation (listening and reading).

3. Please do not discuss any of these stories with the students in the study until all of your students have completed their fourth test. It is necessary for you to limit your comments to the directions that accompany each test and batch of presentation material. It is essential that the students not be informed ahead of time of the stories that will be presented to them.

4. An important part of the design of this study is that the reading times allowed to students who are reading the print versions be the same as the times involved in listening to the recorded version of each story.

5. Tests and answer sheets will be furnished to the teacher in manila envelopes. As each test is completed, replace the answer sheets and tests in the envelopes provided. I will score all tests.

6. Please do not discuss any of the tests with students until the whole experiment, involving all four stories, is completed.

7. Exactly fifteen minutes is to be allowed for the taking of each of the four tests.

8. If any problem arises or is foreseen, please call me as soon as possible at 344-6361.

After the experiment is concluded, each teacher will be furnished with:

1. percentile rankings on the Total Reading Score of all her students participating in the study.

2. a set of all four tests on the stories

3. a distribution of the scores of her students for each story, by presentation mode group, (twelve distributions) and a record of the scores of each student (before the term ends)

4. a copy of each of the four audio-cassettes used

5. an account of the results of the study after statistical procedures have been applied (late spring of 1977).

I am looking forward to working with you on this project. I hope it will be a rewarding educational experience for all of us. Most importantly, I hope that the knowledge produced will be supportive of our ongoing attempts to improve instruction.

Very truly yours,

Richard L. Powers

High Schools in East Baton Rouge Parish

High School	Number Enrolled	Percentage Eligible for Free Lunch in Attendance District
Capitol Senior	1,452	76.2
McKinley Senior	1,206	71.7
Scotlandville Senior	1,185	65.7
Zachary High	700	43.4
Istrouma Senior	1,358	39.3
Baker High	1,640	20.5
Central High	1,154	19.6
Glen Oaks High	1,329	19.5
R. E. Lee High	1,200	8.3
Tara High	1,020	5.6
Belaire High	1,512	5.4
Woodlawn Jr.-Sr.	1,180	4.9
Broadmoor Senior	1,565	.8

The above data are from an, as yet, unreleased publication of the East Baton Rouge Parish School Board:

To Meet the Special Education Needs of Educationally Deprived Children, 1977: A Proposed Project to be Funded by the Elementary and Secondary Education Act.

This information was made available to the investigator by Mr. William Noonan, Director of Federal Programs, East Baton Rouge Parish Public School System.

CONTENT (%)	Identifies characters (43.5% Knowledge)	Identifies places (43.5% Knowledge)	Identifies events (43.5% Knowledge)	Identifies statements (43.5% Knowledge)	Distinguishes correct summary (17.5% Comprehension)	Infers speaker from hypothetical statement (17.5% Comprehension)	Distinguishes technique of characterization (34.5% Analysis)	Distinguishes plot elements (34.5% Analysis)	Selects ironic situation (34.5% Analysis)	Discerns applicable viewpoint (34.5% Analysis)	Identifies mood and/or function of setting (34.5% Analysis)	Selects statement most consistent with overall logic of story (5.0% Evaluation)	Selects hypothetical post-story event most consistent with overall logic of story (5.0% Evaluation)
Characters 24%	12						10						
Setting 14%		8									5		
Plot 25%			11		4			8					
Dialogue 22%				9		12							
Viewpoint 5%										4			
Theme: Message and/or logic 5%												3	2
Irony 5%									4				

Numbers in cells represent the number of items of the 92 achievement test items in each area

Table of Specifications

Multiple Choice Test on "The Tell-Tale Heart"

Choose the answer that is the best conclusion to the main statement and write the letter in the appropriate space on the answer sheet.

1. The flooring in one of the rooms was removed by: (Kn)
   a. the insane man
   b. the old man
   c. a policeman
   d. a neighbor

2. "A pale blue eye with a film over it" was a feature of: (Kn)
   a. the insane man
   b. the old man
   c. a policeman
   d. a neighbor

3. A shriek in the night was reported by: (Kn)
   a. a neighbor
   b. the insane man
   c. the old man
   d. a policeman

4. The murder victim was killed in: (Kn)
   a. the park
   b. his bedroom
   c. the kitchen
   d. his bath

5. The murderer spent much time, while waiting to pounce upon his victim, standing: (Kn)
   a. behind a tree
   b. outside the house
   c. under the stairs
   d. in a doorway

6. The murderer killed his victim by: (Kn)
   a. stabbing him
   b. smothering him
   c. shooting him
   d. choking him

7. The murderer disposed of the body by: (Kn)
   a. burying it in the yard
   b. dropping it in the river
   c. burning it in the furnace
   d. hiding it under the floor

8. The murderer was caught by the police because: (Kn)
   a. they found the body
   b. his hands were bloody
   c. they heard the beating heart
   d. he confessed the crime

"The Tell-Tale Heart" Test (page 2)

9. When the policemen sat down with the insane man, they (Kn)
   a. questioned him suspiciously and angrily
   b. chatted pleasantly of familiar things
   c. asked him for cigars and brandy
   d. were polite but persistent in their questions

10. The shriek in the night was explained as: (Kn)
   a. being the call of an owl
   b. having resulted from an accident
   c. having occurred in a dream
   d. being the shout of a drunk

11. A correct summary of this story would be: (Co)
   a. madness denied; vulture eye described; trial runs with lantern made; intruder discovered; open eye caught by light beam; loud heartbeat heard; victim murdered; police arrive; loud heartbeat heard; murderer discovered
   b. vulture eye described; trial runs with lantern made; intruder discovered; open eye caught by light beam; loud heartbeat heard; victim murdered; police arrive; loud heartbeat heard; murderer discovered
   c. madness denied; vulture eye described; trial runs with lantern made; open eye caught by light beam; intruder discovered; loud heartbeat heard; victim murdered; police arrive; loud heartbeat heard; murderer discovered
   d. madness denied; trial runs with lantern made; intruder discovered; open eye caught by light beam; loud heartbeat heard; victim murdered; police arrive; loud heartbeat heard; murderer discovered; vulture eye described.

12. "It was so high-pitched and queer sounding that it made chills run down my spine, so I just had to report it to you" is a statement that is <u>not</u> in the story; but, if it had been, it would have been made by: (Co)
   a. the insane man
   b. a neighbor
   c. the old man
   d. a policeman

13. "I would like to thank you for waking me up so cheerfully these last few mornings" is a statement that is <u>not</u> in the story; but, if it had been, it would have been made by: (Co)
   a. the insane man
   b. a policeman
   c. a neighbor
   d. the old man

"The Tell-Tale Heart" Test (page 3)

14. "Why, I guess, since there's nothing wrong, we can sit down for just a minute before we have to leave" is a statement that is not in the story; but, if it had been, it would have been made by: (Co)
    a. a neighbor
    b. the old man
    c. a policeman
    d. the insane man.

15. "I am delighted that you have come to visit me, for I am sure that you will believe the truth when I tell it to you and not those lies the others are telling about it all" is a statement that is not in the story; but, if it had been, it would have been made by: (Co)
    a. a policeman
    b. a neighbor
    c. the insane man
    d. the old man

16. Of the methods of characterization listed, the most important one in helping you to feel that the old man is real is: (An)
    a. the words he uses when he talks
    b. the description of the way he walks
    c. the thoughts he has during the story
    d. the description of the way he looks

17. Of the methods of characterization listed, the most important one in helping you to feel that the insane man is real is: (An)
    a. the description of the way he looks
    b. the description of the way he walks
    c. the thoughts he has during the story
    d. the way other people react to him

18. Most short stories have a problem or conflict that makes them move, gives them action; the main problem or conflict in this story is: (An)
    a. to put out the old man's vulture eye
    b. to act nonchalant in front of the police
    c. to hide the body so it won't be found
    d. to commit murder without getting caught

19. Most short stories have a climax or a point where the conflict or problem is worked out, for better or for worse. In this story the climax occurs when: (An)
    a. the victim's heart stops beating
    b. the victim's body is securely hidden
    c. the murderer confesses his guilt
    d. the police arrive and knock at the door

"The Tell-Tale Heart" Test (page 4)

20. The word irony is used for the concept that the way things appear to be is often just the opposite of the way they really are or that things often turn out just opposite from the way they are expected to. An example of irony in this story is that: (An)
    a. the victim, who is thought to be so ugly, is really a beautiful person deep inside
    b. the police, who have come to investigate a complaint of possible violence, remain to discover a murder
    c. the murderer is able to dismember the victim entirely without leaving a single trace of blood anywhere
    d. the murderer is revealed, not by the victim's heartbeat as he imagines, but by the loudness with which he hears his own

21. Viewpoint in a short story or novel can be described as the position from which the author lets the reader see and hear what is going on and also how much the author lets the reader know about what is going on. The viewpoint in this story would be best described as: (An)
    a. third person omniscient, with the reader having access to all aspects of the story, including what each character is thinking
    b. first person, with the reader hearing the story as it is told by a character in the story who may be either a main character or a minor one
    c. third person objective, with the reader being allowed to learn of developments about as he would learn of them when seeing a play
    d. third person narrator, with the story being told by an unidentified person who is not a character in the story but who knows what happened

22. To whatever extent the description of the place in this story contributes to the mood or tone of the story, it tends to make it: (An)
    a. frightening
    b. cheerful
    c. mournful
    d. dignified

23. Of the following statements, the one that best communicates the basic message or intention of this story is that: (Ev)
    a. madmen can be very cleverly unaware of their madness
    b. murderers are always discovered and punished
    c. murder are usually committed for some trivial reason
    d. the senses of madmen are always very sharp and perceptive

Multiple Choice Test on "The Lottery"

Choose the answer that is the best conclusion to the main statement and write the letter in the appropriate space on the answer sheet.

1. The official who runs the lottery is: (Kn)
   a. Mr. Summers, the coal merchant
   b. Old Man Warner, oldest man in town
   c. Bill Hutchinson, Tessie's husband
   d. Jack Anderson, the policeman

2. The person finally selected by the lottery is: (Kn)
   a. Old Man Warner
   b. Jack Anderson
   c. Tessie Hutchinson
   d. Little Dave Hutchinson

3. The person who complains about modern changes in the lottery most loudly is: (Kn)
   a. Tessie Hutchinson
   b. Old Man Warner
   c. Mr. Summers
   d. Jack Anderson

4. During the year when it is not in use, the lottery box is sometimes left: (Kn)
   a. in a vault in the courthouse
   b. under Mr. Summers's house
   c. out in the square on the ground
   d. on a shelf in the grocery store

5. The annual drawing of the lottery takes place: (Kn)
   a. in the town square
   b. in the courthouse
   c. on the football field
   d. in the village church

6. The person selected by the lottery: (Kn)
   a. has a stone monument raised to him or her
   b. is stoned to death by all the villagers
   c. has a stone fence built at his house
   d. must remove all the stones from the streets

7. The lottery in this story is held on: (Kn)
   a. a crisp October afternoon before supper
   b. a dark December night after Christmas
   c. a rainy April morning before breakfast
   d. a lovely June morning just before lunch

"The Lottery" Test (page 2)

8. The procedure of the lottery involves the drawing of: (Kn)
   a. a slip of paper by the head of each household and then a second drawing to select one member of the selected family
   b. slips of paper by the head of each household for all the members of that family, who then point to the member selected
   c. a slip of paper by everybody in town, who must hold it until the others have drawn and then hold it up for everyone to see
   d. a slip of paper by the head of each household, who, when selected, vote to choose the final lottery selection from all the others

9. "Pack of crazy fools. Listening to the young folks, nothing's good enough for them. Next thing you know, they'll be wanting to go back to living in caves, nobody work any more, live that way for a while." This statement is made by: (Kn)
   a. Mr. Summers
   b. Tessie Hutchinson
   c. Old Man Warner
   d. Mr. Graves

10. "I think we ought to start over. I tell you it wasn't fair. You didn't give him time enough to choose. Everybody saw that." This statement was made by: (Kn)
   a. Old Man Warner
   b. Tessie Hutchinson
   c. Jack Anderson
   d. Mrs. Watson

11. A correct summary of this story would be: (Co)
   a. children gather stones; other folks arrive; officials arrive with lottery equipment; person later selected arrives; slips are drawn; second slips are drawn; everyone picks up stones; person selected receives results of being chosen
   b. officials arrive with lottery equipment; children gather stones; other folks arrive; person later selected arrives; slips are drawn; second slips are drawn; everyone picks up stones; person selected receives results of being chosen
   c. person later selected arrives; children gather stones; other folks arrive; officials arrive with lottery equipment; slips are drawn; second slips are drawn; everyone picks up stones; person selected receives results of being chosen
   d. person later selected arrives; children gather stones; other folks arrive; officials arrive with lottery equipment; slips are drawn; everyone picks up stones; second slips are drawn; person selected receives results of being chosen.

12. "That's right! Hold the box still while I stir up the papers real good. When I call 'em up here to draw, I want everybody to have the same chance" is a statement that is not in the story; but, if it had been, it would have been made by: (Co)
    a. Old Man Warner
    b. Jack Anderson
    c. Bill Hutchinson
    d. Mr. Summers

13. "When I first entered the lottery, we used wood chips 'stead of pieces of paper; and the lottery official sang the chant the way it should be. Things just ain't the way they used to be" is a statement that is not in the story; but, if it had been, it would have been made by: (Co)
    a. Mr. Graves
    b. Old Man Warner
    c. Mr. Summers
    d. Bill Hutchinson

14. "Goodness gracious! Here I am washing the dishes, and they're all down at the lottery! Where's my sweater?" is a statement that is not in the story; but, if it had been, it would have been made by: (Co)
    a. Tessie Hutchinson
    b. Nancy Hutchinson
    c. Dorothy Delacroix
    d. Elizabeth Dunbar

15. Of the methods of characterization listed, the most important one in helping you to understand Old Man Warner is: (An)
    a. the description of his appearance
    b. his thoughts told by the author
    c. the description of his movements
    d. the way he talks and what he says

16. Of the methods of characterization listed, the most important one in helping you to understand Bill Hutchinson is: (An)
    a. the way that he talks and what he says
    b. the description of his appearance
    c. his reactions to the events in the story
    d. his thoughts as told by the author

17. Of the methods of characterization listed, the most important one in helping you to understand Tessie Hutchinson is: (An)
    a. her reaction to the events in the story
    b. the description of her appearance
    c. her thoughts as told by the author
    d. the description of her movements

"The Lottery" Test (page 4)

18. Most short stories have a problem or conflict that makes them move, gives them action; the main problem or conflict in this story is: (An)
    a. for the people of the village to get rid of the lottery after many years
    b. for the village to maintain a tradition of many years that helps their culture
    c. for the people to finish what they are doing and get home in time for the next meal
    d. for a person to be selected by the lottery and receive the resulting treatment

19. Most short stories have a climax or a point where the conflict or problem is worked out, for better or for worse. In this story the climax occurs when: (An)
    a. the lottery is finally proved to be something that is useful in the modern world
    b. the lottery is understood at last to be a part of village life that must be retained
    c. the person who draws the final black spot is given the specified treatment
    d. the stone monument is erected to the person selected by the lottery

20. The word irony is used for the concept that the way things appear to be is often just the opposite of the way they really are or that things often turn out just opposite from the way they are expected to. An example of irony in this story is that: (An)
    a. even though the lottery is not a very important occasion, the people treat it as if it were the most important time of the year
    b. although the villagers let their children gather up great piles of stones, they do not let them use them
    c. while one usually expects the person selected by a lottery to receive pleasant treatment, in this case the winner is the loser
    d. in spite of the fact that the villagers live in a very small town, they still like to cling to practices of long ago

21. Viewpoint in a piece of literature can be described as the position from which the author lets the reader see and hear what is going on and also how much the author lets the reader know about what is going on. Of the four viewpoints listed, the one that would best fit this story is: (An)
    a. third person omniscient, with the reader having access to all aspects of the story, including what each character is thinking
    b. first person, with the reader hearing the story as it is told by a character in the story who may be either a main character or a minor one

(continued)

c. third person objective, with the reader being allowed to learn of developments about as he would learn of them when seeing a play

d. third person narrator, with the story being told by an unidentified person who is not a character in the story but who knows what happened

22. When authors write descriptions in stories of the places (settings) where the stories occur, their descriptions can serve several purposes. Of the purposes for setting listed below, the one that is most appropriate to this story is that: (An)
   a. the mood suggested by the setting is in deliberate contrast with the feelings caused by what happens in the story
   b. the setting is used to furnish the chief obstacle or problem and is, therefore, the basis for the action of the story
   c. the mood suggested by the setting is in deliberate support of the feelings caused by what happens in the story
   d. the setting is itself symbolically representative of the deeper meaning behind all of the action in the story

23. Of the following statements, the one that best communicates the basic message or intention of this story is that: (Ev)
   a. even though people have stopped living in caves and appear to be living in civilized harmony, there is a blood-thirsty savagery that bursts out in spite of laws
   b. people have a tendency to stick to traditional practices even when the original reason for the practice no longer exists or has even been forgotten
   c. although small town people may seem to be friendly and peaceful, underneath it all they are more violent than people who live in cities
   d. in spite of the fact that people set up laws and logic to live by, they had really rather play illegal games with each other's lives

Multiple Choice Test on "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment"

Choose the answer that is the best conclusion to the main statement and write the letter in the appropriate space on the answer sheet.

1. The character who thought up a scheme to hitch whales to icebergs and tow them south is: (Kn)
   a. Dr. Heidegger
   b. Mr. Gascoigne, the politician
   c. Col. Killigrew, the pleasure seeker
   d. Mr. Medbourne, the businessman

2. The character whose fiancee died the night before they were to be married is: (Kn)
   a. Dr. Heidegger
   b. Mr. Medbourne, the businessman
   c. Mr. Gascoigne, the politician
   d. Col. Killigrew, the pleasure seeker

3. The character who does <u>not</u> drink any of the magic liquid is: (Kn)
   a. Dr. Heidegger
   b. Widow Wycherly
   c. Mr. Gascoigne, the politician
   d. Col. Killigrew, the pleasure seeker

4. The entire story takes place: (Kn)
   a. in Dr. Heidegger's study
   b. in a chemistry laboratory
   c. by a Florida lake
   d. in a small restaurant

5. At the end of the story, four of the characters decide to go to: (Kn)
   a. a hospital
   b. Massachusetts
   c. home
   d. Florida

6. The vase containing the magic water is accidentally broken while some of the characters are: (Kn)
   a. fighting each other
   b. dancing with the widow
   c. pouring the water
   d. examining its contents

7. The effect of the magic water upon the characters is to make them: (Kn)
   a. grow temporarily younger
   b. grow permanently younger
   c. see visions of the past
   d. see visions of the future

"Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" Test (page 2)

8. Strange things are said to have happened in Dr. Heidegger's study once when: (Kn)
   a. the doctor was preparing to get married
   b. the four guests met there many years earlier
   c. a patient visited the doctor there
   d. a chambermaid was dusting in it

9. "Think what a sin and shame it would be, if, with your peculiar advantages, you should not become patterns of virtue and wisdom to all the young people of the age!" This line is spoken by: (Kn)
   a. Widow Wycherly
   b. Dr. Heidegger
   c. Mr. Gascoigne, the politician
   d. Mr. Medbourne, the businessman

10. "Nonsense! You might as well ask whether an old woman's wrinkled face could ever bloom again." This line is spoken by: (Kn)
   a. Col. Killigrew, the pleasure seeker
   b. Mr. Gascoigne, the politician
   c. Dr. Heidegger
   d. Widow Wycherly

11. A correct summary of this story would be: (Co)
   a. the doctor demonstrates the effect of the water on an object; four of the characters are described; the place is described; some water is drunk; the subjects of the experiment respond to the treatment; the water is drunk twice more; the subjects are very changed; the water is spilled; the subjects change back; the subjects plan to go somewhere.
   b. four of the characters are described; the place is described; the doctor demonstrates the effect of the water on an object; some water is drunk; the subjects of the experiment respond to the treatment; the water is drunk twice more; the subjects are very changed; the water is spilled; the subjects change back; the subjects plan to go somewhere
   c. the doctor demonstrates the effect of the water on an object; four of the characters are described; the place is described; some water is drunk; the subjects of the experiment respond to the treatment; the subjects are very changed; the water is drunk twice more; the subjects change back; the water is spilled; the subjects plan to go somewhere
   d. the doctor demonstrates the effect of the water on an object; four of the characters are described; the place is described; some water is drunk; the subjects of the experiment respond to the treatment; the subjects are very changed; the water is drunk twice more; the subjects change back; the subjects plan to go somewhere; the water is spilled

"Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" Test (page 3)

12. "If someone had not seen me meeting him that night down in the oak grove, my reputation would not have been ruined; and I would still be invited to dinners in respectable homes" is a statement that is not in the story; but, if it had been, it would have been made by: (Co)
    a. Col. Killigrew, the pleasure seeker
    b. Mr. Medbourne, the businessman
    c. Widow Wycherly
    d. Mr. Gascoigne, the politician

13. "This country is the source of all inspiration! May its flag float forever in freedom as we honor it by worshipping God and holding our families secure under the guiding love of our mothers, sisters, and daughters" is a statement that is not in the story; but, if it had been, it would have been made by: (Co)
    a. Mr. Medbourne, the businessman
    b. Col. Killigrew, the pleasure seeker
    c. Mr. Gascoigne, the politician
    d. Dr. Heidegger

14. "To think that I would reach the point when a fine cut of beef would give me a belly ache and a bottle of excellent sherry would make my head swim before I had it half drunk!" is a statement that is not in the story; but , if it had been, it would have been made by: (Co)
    a. Dr. Heidegger
    b. Mr. Medbourne, the businessman
    c. Mr. Gascoigne, the politician
    d. Col. Killigrew, the pleasure seeker

15. Of the methods of characterization listed, the most important one in helping you to understand Dr. Heidegger is: (An)
    a. the description of his appearance
    b. his thoughts as told by the author
    c. the way he talks and what he says
    d. the description of his movements

**

16. Of the methods of characterization listed, the most important one in helping you to understand Mr. Medbourne is: (An)
    a. his reaction to events in the story
    b. the way he talks and what he says
    c. the description of his appearance
    d. the description of his movements

**Since Item 16 discriminated negatively in the pilot study, it was not counted in the scoring of the test in the main study.

Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" Test (page 4)

17. Of the methods of characterization listed, the most important one in helping you to understand the Widow Wycherly is: (An)
    a. her thoughts as told by the author
    b. her reaction to events in the story
    c. the description of her appearance
    d. the description of her movements

18. Most short stories have a problem or conflict that makes them move, gives them action; the main problem or conflict in this story is: (An)
    a. to determine whether a certain magic water from a legendary fountain will have an effect on those who drink it
    b. for Dr. Heidegger, who hates all people, to enjoy humiliating old friends whom he has invited to visit him
    c. to find out whether people, if given the chance to be young again, would profit from the mistakes they made the first time
    d. for old people to learn that, once life is lived, it is just as well not to be able to live it again

19. Most short stories have a climax or a point where the conflict or problem is worked out, for better or worse. In this story the climax occurs when: (An)
    a. Sylvia's rose, dead and dry for years, blooms again
    b. Clara Wycherly asks Dr. Heidegger to dance with her
    c. the vase containing the magic water crashes to the floor
    d. the magic water begins to have an effect on the four characters

20. The word irony is used for the concept that the way things appear to be is often just the opposite of the way they really are or that things often turn out just opposite from the way they are expected to. An example of irony in this story is that: (An)
    a. although the widow and the three gentlemen laugh at the idea that they would waste a second chance at youth, the moment they begin to get younger they start to misbehave
    b. although the widow and the three gentlemen are very old, they have come to visit Dr. Heidegger out of curiosity
    c. in spite of his unhappy experience at the death of Sylvia, Dr. Heidegger has remained interested in people
    d. even though the mirror on the wall has been said to have ghosts in it, the large black book did not include any such account anywhere in its many pages of arcane lore

"Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" Test (page 5)

21. Viewpoint in a piece of literature can be described as the position from which the author lets the reader see and hear what is going on and also how much the author lets the reader know about what is going on. Of the four viewpoints listed, the one that would best fit this story is: (An)
    a. third person omniscient, with the reader having access to all aspects of the story, including what each character is thinking
    b. first person, with the reader hearing the story as it is told by a character in the story who may be either a main character or a minor one
    c. third person objective, with the reader being allowed to learn of developments about as he would learn of them when seeing a play
    d. third person narrator, with the story being told by an unidentified person who is not a character in the story but who knows what happened

22. When authors write descriptions in stories of the places (settings) where the stories occur, their descriptions can serve several purposes. Of the purposes for setting listed below, the one that is most appropriate to this story is that: (An)
    a. the mood suggested by the setting is in deliberate contrast with the feelings caused by what happens in the story
    b. the setting is used to furnish the chief obstacle or problem and is, therefore, the basis for the action of the story
    c. the setting is itself symbolically representative of the deeper meaning behind all of the action in the story
    d. the mood suggested by the setting is in deliberate support of the feelings caused by what happens in the story

**

23. Of the projected hypothetical events that might occur after the end of this story, the one that would be most logical and consistent with the rest of the story would be for: (Ev)
    a. the doctor, after the others have left, to produce a large jug of the magic water that he has hidden and pour himself a glass full which he drinks, smiling
    b. the widow and the three gentlemen to realize their foolishness before starting their journey and to decide that they would try to spend the rest of their old age in peaceful dignity
    c. two of the gentlemen to make the doctor sit still while the widow and the other gentleman search the premises for more of the magic water to take with them on their journey

(continued)

d. the doctor to decide to accompany the others on their journey and help them find what they wanted because he felt ashamed for humiliating them so badly

**Since Item 23 discriminated negatively in the pilot study, it was removed from the test for the main study.

Multiple Choice Test on "To Build a Fire"

Choose the answer that is the best conclusion to the main statement and write the letter in the appropriate space on the answer sheet.

1. The character in the story who survived getting his feet wet is: (Kn)
   a. the man
   b. the old-timer
   c. the dog
   d. one of the man's partners

** 2. The character who is waiting at the old claim on the left fork of Henderson Creek is: (Kn)
   a. the old-timer
   b. the dog
   c. the man
   d. one of the man's partners

3. The character with an amber-colored icicle frozen to his chin is: (Kn)
   a. the old-timer
   b. the dog
   c. the man
   d. one of the man's partners

4. This story takes place: (Kn)
   a. on the northern shores of Antarctica
   b. in the Klondike on the Yukon
   c. near a river in northern siberia
   d. in the southern part of Greenland

5. Even in this cold weather, Henderson Creek has thin ice in some places because: (Kn)
   a. the sunshine weakened places where there was no shade
   b. eddies kept the water moving in sharp curves of the creek
   c. where the water is deep, it does not freeze solid
   d. springs of water flowed down the banks under the snow

6. The first fire that the man builds is when: (Kn)
   a. he first gets his feet wet
   b. he stops to eat his lunch
   c. the dog gets his feet wet
   d. he gets cold and tired of walking

**Since Item 2 discriminated negatively in the pilot study, it was not counted in the scoring of the test in the main study.

"To Build a Fire Test" (page 2)

7. The second fire that the man builds goes out when: (Kn)
   a. he puts too much green firewood on at once
   b. the fire melts the snow it is built on and sinks
   c. his tugging at a tree branch spills snow upon it
   d. his foot accidentally knocks the piled wood apart

8. After the third fire goes out, the man tries to catch his dog because he wants to: (Kn)
   a. kill it and thaw out his hands inside its warm body
   b. hang around its neck and make it pull him to safety
   c. drink the brandy in the cask attached to its collar
   d. bury his face in its fur and warm his frozen cheeks

9. "You were right, old hoss; you were right." This line is spoken by: (Kn)
   a. the old-timer
   b. a man on horseback
   c. one of the man's partners
   d. the man

10. The character who says that no man should travel alone when the temperature is more than fifty degrees below zero is: (Kn)
   a. the man
   b. a man on horseback
   c. one of the man's partners
   d. the old-timer

11. A correct summary of this story would be that the man: (Co)
   a. starts up frozen creek; later breaks through ice; shoves dog across some of the ice; stops for lunch; builds fire that goes out; builds fire that goes out; tries to catch dog; runs, falls, and runs; dies; is left by dog
   b. starts up frozen creek; shoves dog across some of the ice; stops for lunch; later breaks through ice; builds fire that goes out; builds fire that goes out; tries to catch dog; runs, falls, and runs; dies, is left by dog.
   c. starts up frozen creek; shoves dog across some of the ice; stops for lunch; later breaks through ice; builds fire that goes out; tries to catch dog; runs, falls, and runs; builds fire that goes out; dies, is left by dog
   d. starts up frozen creek; shoves dog across some of the ice; stops for lunch; later breaks through ice; builds fire that goes out; tries to catch dog; is left by dog; builds fire that goes out; runs, falls, and runs; dies

12. "I wonder what's keeping Bob. He was going to see about getting out logs from the Yukon islands next spring, but he should have been here by now" is a statement that is not in the story; but, if it had been, it would have been made by: (Co)
    a. one of the man's partners
    b. the man
    c. the old-timer
    d. the man on horseback

13. "It's a real bother to have this here stuff freezing on my whiskers, but the taste of good chewing tobacco does cheer a fellow up" is a statement that is not in the story; but, if it had been, it would have been made by: (Co)
    a. the man
    b. the old-timer
    c. the man on horseback
    d. one of the man's partners

14. "I sure hope that cheechako who was through here a while back ain't foolish enough to be out alone in this seventy-five below weather" is a statement that is not in the story; but, if it had been, it would have been made by: (Co)
    a. the man on horseback
    b. one of the man's partners
    c. the old-timer
    d. the man

15. Of the methods of characterization listed, the most important one in helping you to understand the dog is: (An)
    a. the description of his appearance
    b. his thoughts as told by the author
    c. his reactions to events in the story
    d. the description of his movements

16. Of the methods of characterization listed, the most important one in helping you to understand the man is: (An)
    a. the description of his appearance
    b. his thoughts as told by the author
    c. the way he talks and what he says
    d. the description of his movements

17. Most short stories have a problem or conflict that makes them move, gives them action; the main problem or conflict in this story is for the man: (An)
    a. to reach his cabin and partners in spite of the severe weather
    b. to build a fire and dry out his wet feet, shoes, and socks
    c. to catch his dog and use it to keep himself warm for a while
    d. to find out whether he should stay in this cold country or go home

18. Most short stories have a climax or a point where the problem or conflict is worked out, for better or for worse. In this story the climax occurs when: (An)
    a. the man drowses off into a satisfying and comfortable sleep
    b. the man breaks through the ice and wets his feet and legs
    c. the second fire the man builds that day goes out
    d. the man is unable to use the dog to save himself

19. The word irony is used for the concept that the way things appear to be is often just the opposite of the way they really are or that things often turn out just opposite from the way they are expected to. An example of irony in this story is that: (An)
    a. if the man had only listened to the advice of experienced people, he would not have acted in such a way that his death by freezing is assured
    b. if the man had only been careful where he built his second fire, his attempts to get a source of warmth would have succeeded
    c. although this story covers the period of time of all the daylight hours in a day, the sun never does put in an appearance over the horizon
    d. the rational animal, man, is unable to survive the hazards of the wilderness while the animal of lower intelligence, the dog, survives quite well

20. Viewpoint in a piece of literature can be described as the position from which the author lets the reader see and hear what is going on and also how much the author lets the reader know about what is going on. Of the four viewpoints listed, the one that would best fit this story is: (An)
    a. first person, with the reader hearing the story as it is told by a character in the story who may be either a main character or a minor one
    b. third person objective, with the reader being allowed to learn of developments about as he would learn of them when seeing a play

c. third person omniscient, with the reader having access to all aspects of the story, including what each character is thinking
d. third person narrator, with the story being told by an unidentified person who is not a character in the story but who knows what happened

21. To whatever extent the description of the place in this story contributes to the mood or tone of the story, it tends to make it: (An)
a. irritating
b. cheerful
c. reverent
d. gloomy

22. When authors write descriptions in stories of the places (settings) where the stories occur, their descriptions can serve several purposes. Of the purposes for setting listed below, the one that is most appropriate to this story is that: (An)
a. the setting is used to furnish the chief obstacle in the problem and is, therefore, the basis for the action of the story
b. the mood suggested by the setting is in deliberate contrast with the feelings caused by what happens in the story
c. the mood suggested by the setting is in deliberate support of the feelings caused by what happens in the story
d. the setting is used to reflect the personality of the main character because he is so well suited to live in this environment

**

23. Of the projected hypothetical events that might occur after the end of this story, the one that would be most logical and consistent with the rest of the story would be for: (Ev)
a. the dog to go get his partners and lead them back that night so that they, finding him alive, save him
b. the man's body to remain in that spot for years before it is discovered, still frozen in the same position
c. the partners of the man to come along the next day and find him frozen in the same position he died in
d. the man to regain consciousness, warmed by a sudden break in the cost weather, and struggle by himself to the cabin

**Since Item 23 discriminated negatively in the pilot study, it was removed from the test for the main study.

ANSWER SHEET

NAME_____ SCHOOL_____

AGE_____ BOY____ GIRL____ GRADE_____ PERIOD_____

STORY_____

1. (a) (b) (c) (d)
2. (a) (b) (c) (d)
3. (a) (b) (c) (d)
4. (a) (b) (c) (d)
5. (a) (b) (c) (d)
6. (a) (b) (c) (d)
7. (a) (b) (c) (d)
8. (a) (b) (c) (d)
9. (a) (b) (c) (d)
10. (a) (b) (c) (d)
11. (a) (b) (c) (d)
12. (a) (b) (c) (d)
13. (a) (b) (c) (d)
14. (a) (b) (c) (d)
15. (a) (b) (c) (d)
16. (a) (b) (c) (d)
17. (a) (b) (c) (d)
18. (a) (b) (c) (d)
19. (a) (b) (c) (d)
20. (a) (b) (c) (d)
21. (a) (b) (c) (d)
22. (a) (b) (c) (d)
23. (a) (b) (c) (d)

INSTRUCTIONS FOR PRESENTING "THE TELL-TALE HEART" IN ITS THREE MODES AND ADMINISTERING THE TEST THAT FOLLOWS

To the group that reads, say:

TODAY YOU ARE GOING TO READ SILENTLY AT YOUR DESKS A STORY BY EDGAR ALLAN POE. YOU WILL HAVE FIFTEEN MINUTES TO READ THIS STORY, "THE TELL-TALE HEART." AFTER READING THE STORY, YOU WILL TAKE A TEST ON IT. YOUR SCORE ON THE TEST WILL COUNT ON YOUR SECOND NINE-WEEKS GRADE. WHEN I SAY "BEGIN," START READING. WHEN I SAY "STOP," STOP READING AND CLOSE YOUR BOOKS. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions. Then say, "BEGIN."

After 15 minutes, say, "STOP. CLOSE YOUR BOOKS."

To the group that listens, say:

TODAY YOU ARE GOING TO LISTEN TO A RECORDED READING OF A STORY BY EDGAR ALLAN POE. THE TITLE OF THE STORY IS "THE TELL-TALE HEART." AFTER LISTENING TO THE STORY, YOU WILL TAKE A TEST ON IT. YOUR SCORE ON THE TEST WILL COUNT ON YOUR SECOND NINE-WEEKS GRADE. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions. Then play Side Two of the cassette recording. The recording on Side Two is the one specified to be used in this experiment. The recording lasts 15 minutes.

To the group that views, say:

TODAY YOU ARE GOING TO VIEW A FILM VERSION OF A STORY BY EDGAR ALLAN POE. THE TITLE OF THE STORY IS "THE TELL-TALE HEART." AFTER VIEWING THE FILM, YOU WILL TAKE A TEST ON THE STORY. YOUR SCORE ON THE TEST WILL COUNT ON YOUR SECOND NINE-WEEKS GRADE. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions. Then project the film. The film lasts 8 minutes.

After the group has finished reading, listening, or viewing, say,

THE TEST ON "THE TELL-TALE HEART" CONSISTS OF TWENTY-THREE MULTIPLE CHOICE ITEMS. DO NOT MARK ON THE QUESTION SHEETS. DO NOT WRITE YOUR NAME ON THE QUESTION SHEETS.

At this point distribute the question sheets and the answer sheets and say, LEAVE THE QUESTION SHEETS FACE DOWN ON YOUR DESK.

ON THE SEPARATE ANSWER SHEET THAT HAS BEEN FURNISHED TO YOU, WRITE, IN THE SPACES PROVIDED, YOUR NAME, THE NAME OF THE SCHOOL, YOUR

AGE, CHECK BOY OR GIRL, WRITE YOUR GRADE (TENTH, ELEVENTH, OR TWELFTH), THE NUMBER OF THIS PERIOD, AND THE NAME OF THIS STORY: "THE TELL-TALE HEART."

When they have completed the information at the top of the answer sheet, say,

INDICATE YOUR ANSWERS ON THE ANSWER SHEET BY DARKENING WITH YOUR PENCIL THE SPACE BETWEEN THE PARENTHESES OCCUPIED BY THE LETTER THAT YOU HAVE CHOSEN AS YOUR ANSWER. COMPLETELY BLOT OUT THE LETTER THAT YOU HAVE CHOSEN. IF YOU CHANGE YOUR ANSWER, ERASE YOUR FIRST ANSWER COMPLETELY.

The teacher might at this point illustrate the procedure on the chalkboard. Then say,

IN SOME OF THE ITEMS, MORE THAN ONE OF THE POSSIBLE CHOICES MAY SEEM CORRECT TO YOU. CHOOSE THE ONE THAT SEEMS MOST CORRECT. THERE WILL BE NO PENALTY FOR GUESSING WRONG, BUT YOU SHOULD TRY TO THINK EACH QUESTION THROUGH CAREFULLY BEFORE ANSWERING. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions and then say,

YOU WILL HAVE FIFTEEN MINUTES TO TAKE THIS TEST. WHEN I SAY, "BEGIN," TURN YOUR QUESTION SHEETS OVER AND START WITH NUMBER ONE. WHEN I SAY "STOP," TURN YOUR ANSWER SHEET FACE DOWN.

BEGIN.

After 15 minutes, say, "STOP."

INSTRUCTIONS FOR PRESENTING "THE LOTTERY" IN ITS THREE MODES AND ADMINISTERING THE TEST THAT FOLLOWS

To the group that reads, say:

TODAY YOU ARE GOING TO READ SILENTLY AT YOUR DESKS A STORY BY SHIRLEY JACKSON. YOU WILL HAVE TWENTY-FOUR MINUTES TO READ THIS STORY, "THE LOTTERY." AFTER READING THE STORY, YOU WILL TAKE A TEST ON IT. YOUR SCORE ON THE TEST WILL COUNT ON YOUR SECOND NINE-WEEKS GRADE. WHEN I SAY "BEGIN," START READING. WHEN I SAY "STOP," STOP READING AND CLOSE YOUR BOOKS. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions. Then say, "BEGIN."

After 24 minutes, say "STOP, CLOSE YOUR BOOKS."

To the group that listens, say:

TODAY YOU ARE GOING TO LISTEN TO A RECORDED READING OF A STORY BY SHIRLEY JACKSON. THE TITLE OF THE STORY IS "THE LOTTERY." AFTER LISTENING TO THE STORY, YOU WILL TAKE A TEST ON IT. YOUR SCORE ON THE TEST WILL COUNT ON YOUR SECOND NINE-WEEKS GRADE. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions. Then play Side Two of the cassette recording. The recording on Side Two is the one specified to be used in this experiment. The recording lasts approximately 24 minutes.

To the group that views, say:

TODAY YOU ARE GOING TO VIEW A FILM VERSION OF A STORY BY SHIRLEY JACKSON. THE TITLE OF THE STORY IS "THE LOTTERY." AFTER VIEWING THE FILM, YOU WILL TAKE A TEST ON THE STORY. YOUR SCORE ON THE TEST WILL COUNT ON YOUR SECOND NINE-WEEKS GRADE. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions. Then project the film. The film lasts 18 minutes.

After the group has finished reading, listening, or viewing, say,

THE TEST ON "THE LOTTERY" CONSISTS OF TWENTY-THREE MULTIPLE CHOICE ITEMS. DO NOT MARK ON THE QUESTION SHEETS. DO NOT WRITE YOUR NAME ON THE QUESTION SHEETS.

At this point, distribute the question sheets and the answer sheets and say, LEAVE THE QUESTION SHEETS FACE DOWN ON YOUR DESK.

ON THE SEPARATE ANSWER SHEET THAT HAS BEEN FURNISHED TO YOU, WRITE, IN THE SPACES PROVIDED, YOUR NAME, THE NAME OF THIS SCHOOL, YOUR AGE, CHECK BOY OR GIRL, WRITE YOUR GRADE (TENTH, ELEVENTH, OR TWELFTH), THE NUMBER OF THIS PERIOD, AND THE NAME OF THIS STORY: "THE LOTTERY."

When they have completed the information at the top of the answer sheet, say,

INDICATE YOUR ANSWERS ON THE ANSWER SHEET BY DARKENING WITH YOUR PENCIL THE SPACE BETWEEN THE PARENTHESES OCCUPIED BY THE LETTER THAT YOU HAVE CHOSEN AS YOUR ANSWER. COMPLETELY BLOT OUT THE LETTER THAT YOU HAVE CHOSEN. IF YOU CHANGE YOUR ANSWER, ERASE YOUR FIRST ANSWER COMPLETELY. (The teacher might illustrate on the chalkboard.)

Then say,

IN SOME OF THE ITEMS, MORE THAN ONE OF THE POSSIBLE CHOICES MAY SEEM CORRECT TO YOU. CHOOSE THE ONE THAT SEEMS MOST CORRECT. THERE WILL BE NO PENALTY FOR GUESSING WRONG, BUT YOU SHOULD TRY TO THINK EACH QUESTION THROUGH CAREFULLY BEFORE ANSWERING. YOU WILL HAVE FIFTEEN MINUTES TO TAKE THIS TEST. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions and then say,

WHEN I SAY "BEGIN," TURN YOUR QUESTION SHEETS OVER AND START WITH NUMBER ONE. WHEN I SAY "STOP," TURN YOUR ANSWER SHEET FACE DOWN. (Pause) BEGIN.

After 15 minutes, say, "STOP."

INSTRUCTIONS FOR PRESENTING "DR. HEIDEGGER'S EXPERIMENT" IN ITS THREE MODES AND ADMINISTERING THE TEST THAT FOLLOWS

To the group that reads, say:

TODAY YOU ARE GOING TO READ SILENTLY AT YOUR DESKS A STORY BY NATHANIEL HAWTHORNE. YOU WILL HAVE TWENTY-FIVE MINUTES TO READ THIS STORY, "DR. HEIDEGGER'S EXPERIMENT." AFTER READING THE STORY, YOU WILL TAKE A TEST ON IT. YOUR SCORE ON THE TEST WILL COUNT ON YOUR SECOND NINE-WEEKS GRADE. WHEN I SAY "BEGIN," START READING. WHEN I SAY "STOP," STOP READING AND CLOSE YOUR BOOKS. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions. Then say, "BEGIN."

After 25 minutes, say, "STOP. CLOSE YOUR BOOKS."

To the group that listens, say:

TODAY YOU ARE GOING TO LISTEN TO A RECORDED READING OF A STORY BY NATHANIEL HAWTHORNE. THE TITLE OF THE STORY IS "DR. HEIDEGGER'S EXPERIMENT." AFTER LISTENING TO THE STORY, YOU WILL TAKE A TEST ON IT. YOUR SCORE ON THE TEST WILL COUNT ON YOUR SECOND NINE-WEEKS GRADE. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions. Then play Side Two of the cassette recording. The recording on Side Two is the one specified to be used in this experiment. The recording lasts 25 minutes.

To the group that views, say:

TODAY YOU ARE GOING TO VIEW A FILM VERSION OF A STORY BY NATHANIEL HAWTHORNE. THE TITLE OF THE STORY IS "DR. HEIDEGGER'S EXPERIMENT." AFTER VIEWING THE FILM, YOU WILL TAKE A TEST ON THE STORY. YOUR SCORE ON THE TEST WILL COUNT ON YOUR SECOND NINE-WEEKS GRADE. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions. Then project the film. The film lasts 22 minutes.

After the group has finished reading, listening, or viewing, say,

THE TEST ON "DR. HEIDEGGER'S EXPERIMENT" CONSISTS OF TWENTY-TWO MULTIPLE CHOICE ITEMS. DO NOT MARK ON THE QUESTION SHEETS. DO NOT WRITE YOUR NAME ON THE QUESTION SHEETS.

At this point, distribute the question sheets and the answer sheets and say, LEAVE THE QUESTION SHEETS FACE DOWN ON YOUR DESK.

ON THE SEPARATE ANSWER SHEET THAT HAS BEEN FURNISHED TO YOU, WRITE, IN THE SPACES PROVIDED, YOUR NAME, THE NAME OF THIS SCHOOL, YOUR

AGE, CHECK BOY OR GIRL, WRITE YOUR GRADE (TENTH, ELEVENTH, OR TWELFTH), THE NUMBER OF THIS PERIOD, AND THE NAME OF THIS STORY: "DR. HEIDEGGER'S EXPERIMENT."

When they have completed the information at the top of the answer sheet, say,

INDICATE YOUR ANSWERS ON THE ANSWER SHEET BY DARKENING WITH YOUR PENCIL THE SPACE BETWEEN THE PARENTHESES OCCUPIED BY THE LETTER THAT YOU HAVE CHOSEN AS YOUR ANSWER. COMPLETELY BLOT OUT THE LETTER THAT YOU HAVE CHOSEN. IF YOU CHANGE YOUR ANSWER, ERASE YOUR FIRST ANSWER COMPLETELY. (The teacher might illustrate on the chalkboard.) Then say,

IN SOME OF THE ITEMS, MORE THAN ONE OF THE POSSIBLE CHOICES MAY SEEM CORRECT TO YOU. CHOOSE THE ONE THAT SEEMS MOST CORRECT. THERE WILL BE NO PENALTY FOR GUESSING WRONG, BUT YOU SHOULD TRY TO THINK EACH QUESTION THROUGH CAREFULLY BEFORE ANSWERING. YOU WILL HAVE FIFTEEN MINUTES TO TAKE THIS TEST. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions and then say,

WHEN I SAY "BEGIN," TURN YOUR QUESTION SHEETS OVER AND START WITH NUMBER ONE. WHEN I SAY "STOP," TURN YOUR ANSWER SHEET FACE DOWN. (Pause) BEGIN.

After 15 minutes, say, "STOP."

INSTRUCTIONS FOR PRESENTING "TO BUILD A FIRE" IN ITS THREE MODES AND ADMINISTERING THE TEST THAT FOLLOWS

To the group that reads, say:

TODAY YOU ARE GOING TO READ SILENTLY AT YOUR DESKS A STORY BY JACK LONDON. YOU WILL HAVE FORTY-FIVE MINUTES TO READ THIS STORY, "TO BUILD A FIRE." TOMORROW AT THIS PERIOD YOU WILL TAKE A TEST ON IT. YOUR SCORE ON THE TEST WILL COUNT ON YOUR SECOND NINE-WEEKS GRADE. WHEN I SAY "BEGIN," START READING. WHEN I SAY "STOP," STOP READING AND CLOSE YOUR BOOKS. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions. Then say, "BEGIN."

After 45 minutes, say, "STOP, CLOSE YOUR BOOKS."

To the group that listens, say

TODAY YOU ARE GOING TO LISTEN TO A RECORDED READING OF A STORY BY JACK LONDON. THE TITLE OF THE STORY IS "TO BUILD A FIRE." TOMORROW YOU WILL TAKE A TEST ON IT. YOUR SCORE ON THE TEST WILL COUNT ON YOUR SECOND NINE-WEEKS GRADE. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions. Then play Side Two of the cassette recording. The recording on Side Two is the one specified to be used in this experiment. The recording lasts 45 minutes.

To the group that views, say:

TODAY YOU ARE GOING TO VIEW A FILM VERSION OF A STORY BY JACK LONDON. THE TITLE OF THE STORY IS "TO BUILD A FIRE." TOMORROW YOU WILL TAKE A TEST ON THE STORY. YOUR SCORE ON THE TEST WILL COUNT ON YOUR SECOND NINE-WEEKS GRADE. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions. Then project the film. The film lasts 14½ minutes.

On the next calendar day after the presentations, to each group say,

THE TEST ON "TO BUILD A FIRE" CONSISTS OF TWENTY-TWO MULTIPLE CHOICE ITEMS. DO NOT MARK ON THE QUESTION SHEETS. DO NOT WRITE YOUR NAME ON THE QUESTION SHEETS.

At this point, distribute the question sheets and the answer sheets and say, LEAVE THE QUESTION SHEETS FACE DOWN ON YOUR DESK.

ON THE SEPARATE ANSWER SHEET THAT HAS BEEN FURNISHED TO YOU, WRITE, IN THE SPACED PROVIDED, YOUR NAME, THE NAME OF THIS SCHOOL, YOUR AGE, CHECK BOY OR GIRL, WRITE YOUR GRADE (TENTH, ELEVENTH, OR TWELFTH), THE NUMBER OF THIS PERIOD, AND THE NAME OF THIS STORY: "TO BUILD A FIRE."

When they have completed the information at the top of the answer sheet, say,

INDICATE YOUR ANSWERS ON THE ANSWER SHEET BY DARKENING WITH YOUR PENCIL THE SPACE BETWEEN THE PARENTHESES OCCUPIED BY THE LETTER THAT YOU HAVE CHOSEN AS YOUR ANSWER. COMPLETELY BLOT OUT THE LETTER THAT YOU HAVE CHOSEN. IF YOU CHANGE YOUR ANSWER, ERASE YOUR FIRST ANSWER COMPLETELY. (The teacher might illustrate on the chalkboard.)

Then say,

IN SOME OF THE ITEMS, MORE THAN ONE OF THE POSSIBLE CHOICES MAY SEEM CORRECT TO YOU. CHOOSE THE ONE THAT SEEMS MOST CORRECT. THERE WILL BE NO PENALTY FOR GUESSING WRONG, BUT YOU SHOULD TRY TO THINK EACH QUESTION THROUGH CAREFULLY BEFORE ANSWERING. YOU WILL HAVE FIFTEEN MINUTES TO TAKE THIS TEST. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?

Answer any reasonable questions and then say,

WHEN I SAY "BEGIN," TURN YOUR QUESTION SHEETS OVER AND START WITH NUMBER ONE. WHEN I SAY "STOP," TURN YOUR ANSWER SHEET FACE DOWN. (Pause) BEGIN.

After 15 minutes, say, "STOP."

SCHEDULE FOR EXPERIMENTAL STUDY: BAKER HIGH SCHOOL - Mrs. Spiers

Thursday, Oct. 14, and Friday, Oct. 15: CTBS Reading Test

Monday, Oct. 25: "The Tell-Tale Heart" - presentations and tests

Monday, Nov. 1: "The Lottery" - presentations and tests

Monday, Nov. 8: "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" - presentations and tests

Monday, Nov. 15: "To Build a Fire" - presentations only

Tuesday, Nov. 16: "To Build a Fire" - tests only

First Period: Reads all four stories.

Second Period: Listens to all four stories.

Third Period: Views all four films.

SCHEDULE FOR EXPERIMENTAL STUDY: GLEN OAKS HIGH SCHOOL - Mrs. Freiberg

Monday, Oct. 25: "The Lottery" - presentations and tests

Monday, Nov. 1: "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" - presentations and tests

Monday, Nov. 8: "To Build a Fire" - presentations only

Tuesday, Nov. 9: "To Build a Fire" - tests only

Monday, Nov. 15: "The Tell-Tale Heart" - presentations and tests

First Period: Views all four films.

Second Period: Reads all four stories.

Fourth Period: Listens to all four stories.

CTBS, Reading Section: To be scheduled later.

SCHEDULE FOR EXPERIMENTAL STUDY: BELAIRE HIGH SCHOOL - Mrs. Stewart

Wednesday, Oct. 20 - CTBS, Reading Section

Monday, Oct. 25: "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" - presentations and tests

Monday, Nov. 1: "To Build a Fire" - presentations only

Tuesday, Nov. 2: "To Build a Fire" - tests only

Monday, Nov. 8: "The Tell-Tale Heart" - presentations and tests

Monday, Nov. 15: "The Lottery" - presentations and tests

First Period: Views all four films.

Second Period: Reads all four stories

Third Period: Listens to all four stories.

SCHEDULE FOR EXPERIMENTAL STUDY: McKINLEY HIGH SCHOOL - Mrs. Dickinson

Monday, Oct. 25: "To Build a Fire" - presentations only

Tuesday, Oct. 26: "To Build a Fire" - tests only

Monday, Nov. 1: "The Tell-Tale Heart" - presentations and tests

Monday, Nov. 8: "The Lottery" - presentations and tests

Monday, Nov. 15: "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" - presentations and tests

First Period: Listens to all four stories.

Fifth Period: Views all four films.

Sixth Period: Reads all four stories.

CTBS, Reading Section: To be scheduled later.

SCHEDULE FOR EXPERIMENTAL STUDY: SCOTLANDVILLE HIGH SCHOOL - Mrs. Wright

Monday, Oct. 18, and Tuesday, Oct. 19: CTBS Reading Test

Wed., Oct. 27: "The Tell-Tale Heart" - presentations and tests

Wed., Nov. 3: "The Lottery" - presentations and tests

Wed., Nov. 10: "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" - presentations and tests

Wed., Nov. 17: "To Build a Fire" - presentations only

Thurs., Nov. 18: "To Build a Fire" - tests only

Second Period: Listens to all four stories.

Third Period: Views all four films.

Fourth Period: Reads all four stories.

SCHEDULE FOR EXPERIMENTAL STUDY: WOODLAWN HIGH SCHOOL - Mrs. Arnold

Tuesday, Oct. 26, and Wednesday, Oct. 27: CTBS Reading Test

Thurs., Oct. 28: "The Lottery" - presentations and tests

Wed., Nov. 3: "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment" - presentations and tests

Tues., Nov. 9: "To Build a Fire" - presentations only

Wed., Nov. 10: "To Build a Fire" - tests only

Wed., Nov. 17: "The Tell-Tale Heart" - presentations and tests

First Period: Reads all four stories.

Second Period: Views all four films.

Fifth Period: Listens to all four stories.

SCHEDULE FOR EXPERIMENTAL STUDY

I. Monday, Oct. 25:
Baker - "The Tell-Tale Heart"
Glen Oaks - "The Lottery"
Belaire - "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment"
McKinley - "To Build a Fire" - presentation

Tuesday, Oct. 26:
McKinley - "To Build a Fire" - test

Wednesday, Oct. 27:
Scotlandville - "The Tell-Tale Heart"

Thursday, Oct. 28:
Woodlawn - "The Lottery"

II. Monday, Nov. 1:
Baker - "The Lottery"
Glen Oaks - "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment"
Belaire - "To Build a Fire" - presentation
McKinley - "The Tell-Tale Heart"

Tuesday, Nov. 2:
Belaire - "To Build a Fire" - test

Wednesday, Nov. 3:
Scotlandville - "The Lottery"
Woodlawn - "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment"

III. Monday, Nov. 8:
Baker - "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment"
Glen Oaks - "To Build a Fire" - presentation
Belaire - "The Tell-Tale Heart"
McKinley - "The Lottery"

Tuesday, Nov. 9:
Glen Oaks - "To Build a Fire" - test
Woodlawn - "To Build a Fire" - presentation

Wednesday, Nov. 10:
Scotlandville - "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment"
Woodlawn - "To Build a Fire" - test

IV. Monday, Nov. 15:
Baker - "To Build a Fire" - presentation
Glen Oaks - "The Tell-Tale Heart"
Belaire - "The Lottery"
McKinley - "Dr. Heidegger's Experiment"

Tuesday, Nov. 16:
Baker - "To Build a Fire" - test

Wednesday, Nov. 17:
Scotlandville - "To Build a Fire" - presentation
Woodlawn - "The Tell-Tale Heart"

Thursday, Nov. 18:
Scotlandville - "To Build a Fire" - test

Table 12

Means of Reading (M_x) and Short Stories (M_y) Tests and Adjusted Y Means ($M_{y.x}$): Middle Range Socioeconomic Groups

Groups	N	M_x	M_y	$M_{y.x}$
Listeners	24	42.50	55.42	56.81
Readers	25	45.64	59.60	59.48
Viewers	19	48.74	57.84	56.24

VITA

Richard L. Powers was born on May 18, 1928, in St. Pauls, North Carolina. He received a B.S. in education from East Carolina University with a major in English and a minor in science. His M.Ed. in secondary school teaching is from Louisiana State University. His Ph.D. in secondary education, with an emphasis in educational media and a minor in English, is also from Louisiana State University. His professional career includes eleven years as a science teacher and fifteen years as an English teacher in the public schools of Louisiana and North Carolina. He is married to Susan Cullom Powers; they have two daughters, Prudence and Rachel.

EXAMINATION AND THESIS REPORT

Candidate: Richard L. Powers

Major Field: Education

Title of Thesis: A STUDY OF THREE METHODS OF PRESENTING SHORT STORIES

Approved:

Charlie W. Roberts Jr.
Major Professor and Chairman

James D. Traynham
Dean of the Graduate School

EXAMINING COMMITTEE:

Dan Adams

B. F. Beeson

E. C. Eubanks

L. L. Kilgore

Thurman McNeil

David Madden

Date of Examination:

June 24, 1977